Published online 2017 November 15.

Retracted Article: Isolation of *Lactobacillus* Species from Domestic Dairy Products of Mahabad City

Saman Mahdavi ¹, ^{*}, Alireza Isazadeh², Saba Haj Azimian², Nazila Moghtaran Bonab³, Fariba Shekar⁴ and Ali Asgharian⁵

¹Department of Microbiology, Maragheh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Maragheh, Iran

²Department of Genetic, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

³Department of Molecular Biology, Tabriz University, Tabriz, Iran

⁴Department of Food Engineering, Maragheh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Maragheh, Iran
⁵Department of Microbiology, Bonab Branch, Islamic Azad University, Bonab, Iran

Corresponding author: Saman Mahdavi, Department of Microbiology, Maragheh Branch, Islamic Azad University, Maragheh, Iran. Tel: +1-9142688143, s.mahdavi@iau-maragheh.ac.ir

Received 2016 December 30; Revised 2017 February 02; Accepted 2017 February 02.

Abstract

Background: *Lactobacillus* is the most important group of lactic acid bacteria black reduce a id lactic through fermentation of glucose, which is an important process in dairy production. Due to the natural more because stems of milk, the traditional dairy products provide a suitable culture for growth and proliferation of *Lactobacillus* structs.

Objectives: The aim of this study was to investigate *Lactobacillus* specie from domestic dairy products of Mahabad city. **Methods:** In this study, 90 samples of cheese, yogurt, and dough were concreded from the nearby villages of Mahabad. For the isolation of *Lactobacillus*, samples were cultured in MRS agar and grown colonies here tested gram stain, catalase test, and morphology. Catalase-negative, gram positive, and without spores bacillus identification and purification. Then, oxidase tests, reduce nitrate, and oxidation-reduction was performed on the SIM medium. To item species of *Lactobacillus*, growth in 15°C - 45°C, gas production from glucose with Durham tube to detect homo or hetero Firm intrative, and fermentation Fructose, Maltose, Lactose, Galactose, Mannose, Ribose, Arabinose, Xylose, Cellobiose, Inosite Man, tol. Melezitose, Melibiose, Raffinose, Rhamnose, Trehalose, Salicin, Glycerol and Gluconate and esculin hydrolysis were endiced.

Results: In 3 products, *Lactobacillus plantarum* strain was identiced, which was in cheese (46%) in comparison with yogurt and dough (respectively 13% and 36%).

Conclusions: Based on findings in this study, where expected better culture for growth and proliferation of *Lactobacillus* when compared with yogurt and dough and the *Lactobacilus* and *Lactobacilus* strain was the most of milk microflora and traditional dairy products of Mahabad town.

Keywords: Traditional Dairy Products, Cahabad, Lactobacillus

1. Background

A *lactobesil as bacterium* is gram-positive, nonsporulation, metionless, and catalase-negative. These are normal flora of the human body and have a great resistance against salt and antibiotics (1). Probiotic being is the most important of the *Lactobacillus* characteristics; probiotics are the microorganisms where a sufficient number of them were used as a food supplement and provides beneficial effects to the host (2)

Lactobacillus is the normal flora in traditional dairy products and containing probiotic potential such as resistance to gastric acid and bile salts. Production of organic acids and decrease of pH, secretion of antimicrobial compounds, and inhibitors such as bacteriocins, hydrogen peroxide, and compete with pathogens for adhering to the intestine wall, were the *Lactobacillus* effects (3). They are effective in disease improvements such as cancer, peptic ulcer, intestinal inflammation, high blood pressure and cholesterol, diarrhea, allergies, weakened immune systems, as well as lactose intolerance (4, 5). They can be used as natural preservatives in foods with secretion of bacteriocins, which has an inhibitory effect on the growth of spoilage microorganisms (3).

Another important effect of *Lactobacillus*, is antiaflatoxin activity in dairy products (6). This group of bacteria contains the beta-galactosidase enzyme and can hydrolysis lactose in milk and produce lactic acid by this en-

Copyright © 2017, International Journal of Infection. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) which permits copy and redistribute the material just in noncommercial usages, provided the original work is properly cited.

zyme during the fermentation process. Lactic acid is very effective in creation of dairy products flavor (1). *Lactobacillus* also contains proteinase, lipase, and esterase enzyme. Activity of these enzymes in dairy products, leading to create new compounds such as short-chain fatty acids, digest peptides, and production of new amino acids (7).

One of the traditional dairy products that was evaluated in this study is Kurdish dairy cheese that is known as Coupe cheeses. The cheese is prepared by crushing and putting it into a pottery or tin and placed underground for 2 to 3 months. These conditions will provide the perfect environment for growth the microaerophilic bacteria. Coupe cheese is prepared using rennet cheese and without adding any starters. The Coupe cheese structure is granular and dry (8). Traditional yogurt is prepared using yogurt as the starter (9). Natural enzymes of milk such as protease and lipase are the important factors in the development of favorable cheese taste, which were destroyed in the pasteurization process, however the enzymes were not destroyed in traditional cheese (10). The aim of this study is isolation of the Lactobacillus strains from traditional dairy products (cheese, yogurt, dough) of Mahabad city.

2. Methods

From villages in and around Mahabad city, 90 s ples of traditional dairy products were collected, which in cluded 30 samples of yogurt, 30 samples of double, a 30 samples of cheese, which were prepared from 2 ypes of cattle and sheep milk. These samples transported k he microbiology laboratory. At the beginning Ogr from each samples were added into the erlens which the contain-ing of 90 mL sterilized physiological service After homogenization, samples were diluted p to f ap were cultured in MRS agar (Merck, Germany, The following cultured samples were placed in activity jan and then incubated at 30°C for 48 - 72 hour After Aubation, the obtained colonies were performer by gram stain, catalase, and morphology test. Cham-positive, catalase-negative, and with-out spece bacilly swere identified and cultured in the new re incubated in the same condition. plates and

For detection of *Lactobacillus* genus, other tests such as oxidase, reduce of nitrate, oxidation-reduction, and movement in the SIM medium were performed. To identify, the *Lactobacillus* species examined their growth in 15°C and 45°C temperature and fermentation of Fructose, Maltose, Lactose, Galactose, Mannose, Ribose, Arabinose, Xylose, Cellobiose, Inositol, Mannitol, Melezitose, Melibiose, Raffinose, Rhamnose, Trehalose, Salicin, glycerol and Gluconate, and hydrolysis of Esculin.

Furthermore, gas production from glucose was performed with Durham tube for identification of homo or hetero fermentative (12). Finally statistical analysis were performed by Ver21 SPSS software and using t-Test.

3. Results

Among the 90 studied samples, there were *Lactobacillus* in 4 cases of yogurt, 11 cases of dough, and 14 cases of cheese. All *Lactobacillus* were diagnosed as *Lactobacillus plantarum*, due to inability to gas production from glucose, inability to growth at 45°C temperatures, and inability to fermentation of Rhamnose, Gluene, Inositol, and Trehalose. The *Lactobacillus plantarum* f equency is 46%, 36%, and 13% in cheese, dough, and yog st. propectively.

36%, and 13% in cheese, dough, an woget, respectively. According to that may be p.r., say and age of samples were effective in *Lactobacillus* isolation, the samples with *Lactobacillus* were completed with camples without *Lactobacillus*. There were no significant differences in cheese samples (P > 0.00). Additionally, there were no observed significant differences in yogurt and dough in terms of age and sale P = 0.05), powever, pH differences were statistically significant (1 = 0.05).

Discussi

cording to our results, the isolation of Lactobacilom cheese was more compared to the other products (yogurt and dough). The isolated Lactobacillus from cheese were about 46% and all of them were Lactobacillus plantarum. Cheese has special advantages in comparison to other dairy products for probiotic bacteria. Cheese increased viability of probiotics, due to high pH, solid, and pressed structure (that probiotics protect against unsuitable environmental factors), high buffering capacity (due to high levels of protein), fat percent, and particular storage conditions (10). Cheese has a high pH(4/8 - 5/6) in comparison to other products (3/7 - 4/3), which provides more favorable conditions for the growth of probiotics. Cheese contains micronutrient such as decomposed peptides, decomposed fatty acids (from the process of lipolysis), lactose and organic acids (produced by glycolysis), which considered food source of probiotics in the cheese (10).

Hashemi et al., (2013) reported that there were increased numbers of mesophilic *Lactobacillus* at the end of the reaching process in comparison to the beginning of reaching process, in Kurdish cheese. Slowly metabolism of *Lactobacillus* and adaptability with adverse environmental conditions (low pH, low water activity and high NaCl) in comparison to other lactic acid bacteria, were the cause of existence of this bacteria in large amounts at the end of reaching period (13).

Milani (2012), in a study on biological diversity of traditional Kurdish cheese, reported that in the beginning of

able 1. Mean of the pH, Age and Salt and Standard Deviation in Cheese, Yogurt and Dough Traditional			
Dairy Type	рН	Age (Day)	Salt
Cheese	5.45 ± 0.29	56.83 ± 8.8	4.13 ± 1.77
Yogurt	3.59 ± 0.79	4.13 ± 0.81	
Dough	3.63 ± 0.11	7.86 ± 1.33	

Table 2. Number, Source and Gathering Location of Samples with Lactobacillus Cheese Yogurt Dough Samples Cattle Cattle Sheep Cattle Sheep Lactobacillus n (6) n (9) n (8) n (1) n (3) South (5) South(2) South (3) South (8) Sampling location South North (3) North (1) North (1) North (6) Table 3. pH, Age and Salt Difference in Cheese Samples in Terms of Lactobacillus Presence^a рН Age Salt Cheese Group 1 5.45 ± 0.299 3.89 ± 1.86 Group 2 5.46 ± 0.292 4.33 ± 1.72 P value 0.911 0.713 ^aGroup 1: Lactobacillus (+); Group 2: Lactobacillus (-). Table 4. pH, Age and Salt Difference in Yogurt and Dough Samples in Terms of Lacto Age Yogurt Group 1 64 ± 0.153 4 ± 0.816 Group 2 3.58 ± 0.646 4.15 ± 0.833 P value 0.044 0.352 Dough 6.63 ± 0.809 Group 1 3.71 ± 0.006 Group 2 3.67 ± 0.08 6.77 ± 1.33 P value 0.006 0.097 ^aGroup 1: Lactobacillus (+); Grou lus (-)

the ripening period, *Enc. Obacter* and lactic acid bacteria were the most a portant bacterial groups in terms of frequency. Contrary to yeast and mildew, the speed of reduce the number of coliforms and *E.coli* were very high in during ripening period. The results showed that the absence of positive coagulase coliforms, *Salmonella*, and *Staphylococcus* in all cases at the end of the 60 days of the ripening period, which seems has been due to reduced water activity, pH decrease and increase the population of useful microflora of lactic acid bacteria. Furthermore, in the end, the ripening period increased the free fatty acids and amino acids, which were enhances the positive characteristics in

terms of the flavor (14).

Lactobacillus is the dominant species in cheeses that is prepared from raw milk, due to the fact that these bacteria can grow in difficult conditions (15). According to our results, 4 and 11 *Lactobacillus plantarum* strains from yogurt and dough were isolated, respectively. Several factors decreased or had a loss of probiotic growth in the yogurt, such as high acidity, low pH, presence of hydrogen peroxide, bacteria-inhibiting production, dissolved oxygen, and high concentrations of soluble substances. The rapid decline of pH in yogurt fermentation causes the growth of probiotics to stop before enough duplication and increase the other bacteria population in yogurt; the result reduced the number of probiotics bacterial after fermentation and during of storage (10). Lactic acid bacteria constitute an important part of the yogurt microbial population, which with the increase in yogurts age during storage, causes an increase in acidity by lactic acid bacteria and reduces the number of probiotic bacteria (16).

A study was performed by Jokovic et al., (2008) on Kajmak (fermented fatty milk) traditional dairy products and isolated 3 species such as *Lactobacillus kefir*, *Lactobacillus paracasei*, and *Lactobacillus plantarum* (17). During the examination of lactic acid bacteria in Armada traditional cheese (typical Spanish cheese which production from goat's milk) by Herreros et al., (2003) *Lactobacillus plantarum*, *Lactobacilluscasei*, and *Lactobacillusbrevis* species were identified (18). The Fiore Sardo cheese was studied by Munnu et al., (2000) (traditional Italian cheese which production from sheep's raw milk) and showed that hetero fermentative *Lactobacillus* such as *Lactobacillus plantarum* and *Lactobacillus casei* were dominant species during reach (11).

Abdi et al., (2006) studied Lighvan cheese and isolated Lactobacilluscasei as well as Lactobacillusplantarum, which were dominant species (19). Navidghasemizad et al., (2009) reported that Lactobacillusplantarum was the dominant strain in traditional Lighvan cheese (20), as well the Abdi study (19). Durlu-Ozkaya et al., (2001) st died the activity of lactic acid bacteria in Beyaz charter a 'reported that 14 isolates of Lactobacillus plantarum and 3 iso lates of Lactobacillus paracasei were found They should that the Lactobacillus plantarum was the cominant strain in the Beyaz cheese (21). A study performed by Edala-tian et al., (2012) on the Koozeh cherse sourced *Lactobacil*lusplantarum, Lactobacillusbrev, Lactobacilus hlavaty, Lactobacillus delbrueckii, La tobaccius fermentum, and Lacto-bacillus ferment from this encise and showed that the Lactobacillus plantarum warte donient strain (8). Hasanzad Azar and Ehsani (203), epotted that the *plantarum* strain was the chamin of spain is the Coupe local cheese (22). Manok soulou cal. (2003) in assessing the microbial population of a cheese (traditional cheese in southern of Greece), showed that the *plantarum* strains was the dominant strain in this cheese (23). All of these studies are similar to the present study. Results of above studies showed that Lactobacillus plantarum was identified as one of the most common species in the traditional dairy products, however, several studies were unlike our study.

Akabanda et al., (2013) examined fermented milk that was called Nuno (prepared in Ghana and west Africa) in terms of presence of *Lactobacillus* and was clear that *Lactobacillus fermentum* was dominant during the fermentation process and played an important role in the first 6 - 8 hours of fermentation time (24). Mathara et al., (2008) isolated 23 species of *Lactobacillus* from traditional fermented milk (Kulenato) in Kenya, and *Lactobacillus acidophilus*, *Lactobacillus rhamnosus*, *Lactobacillus fermentum*, and *Lactobacillus casei* were most of the isolated strains (25). Yu et al., (2011) isolated 7 strains of *Lactobacillus plantarum* from Mongolian traditional dairy products, while *Lactobacillus delbrueckii*, *Lactobacillus hlavaty*, and *Lactobacillus fermentum* were identified as dominant species (26). The research done by Torres-Lanez et al., (2006) on the properties of natural microflora of Mexican Fresco dates, showed that *Lactobacillus casei* was the dominant strains(15). In the Rossetti et al., (2008) research on the fram padano traditional cheese, *Lactobacillus invaty* and *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* strain were the dominant strains(27).

Generally, in all of researce that has been performed in identifying the spece i of lattic acid bacteria in traditional dairy products, the diffuence in bacterial populations and species was observed. One of the reasons for these differences i i.m. difference in the compounds of cow, sheep, and buffulo park, which were used in production of traditional dairy products. Furthermore diversity of the *Lactobacillus* genus and strains in the traditional dairy products and nographical areas, which all influence the diversity of *Lactobacillus* population and other lactic acid bacteria in traditional dairy products (26).

Characteristics of traditional cheeses are a result of genus diversity, local species, and milk especial native flora (28). Therefore, it is possible that *Lactobacillus* species population are different in each region in traditional dairy products. Based on these results, we can concluded that *Lactobacillus plantarum* is the dominant native micro flora in traditional products (yogurt, dough, and cheese) in Mahabad city. Since natural microbial flora of milk were effective on the flavor, it is possible that *Lactobacillus plantarum* play an important role in the taste and aroma in this product.

Footnotes

Authors' Contribution: Saman Mahdavi designed the study concepts, analyzed the data and prepared the manuscript; Alireza Isazadeh, Saba Haj Azimian, Fariba Shekar, and Ali Asgharian conducted experimental studies and drafted the manuscript; Nazila Moghtaran Bonab was involved in drafting the manuscript and final approval the manuscript.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declared that they had no conflicts of interest.

References

- Gomes AMP, Malcata FX. Bifidobacterium spp. and Lactobacillus acidophilus: biological, biochemical, technological and therapeutical properties relevant for use as probiotics. *Trends Food Sci Technol.* 1999;10(4-5):139-57. doi: 10.1016/s0924-2244(99)00033-3.
- Soccol CR, Vandenberghe L, Spier MR, Medeiros ABP, Yamaguishi CT, Lindner JDD. The potential of probiotics: a review. *Food Technol Biotechnol*. 2010;**48**(4):413–34.
- Kailasapathy K, Chin J. Survival and therapeutic potential of probiotic organisms with reference to Lactobacillus acidophilus and Bifidobacterium spp. *Immunol Cell Biol.* 2000;**78**(1):80–8. doi: 10.1046/j.1440-1711.2000.00886.x. [PubMed: 10651933].
- Parvez S, Malik KA, Ah Kang S, Kim HY. Probiotics and their fermented food products are beneficial for health. *J Appl Microbiol.* 2006;**100**(6):1171-85. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2672.2006.02963.x. [PubMed: 16696665].
- Ceapa C, Wopereis H, Rezaiki L, Kleerebezem M, Knol J, Oozeer R. Influence of fermented milk products, prebiotics and probiotics on microbiota composition and health. *Best Pract Res Clin Gastroenterol.* 2013;27(1):139–55. doi: 10.1016/j.bpg.2013.04.004. [PubMed: 23768559].
- Tropcheva R, Nikolova D, Evstatieva Y, Danova S. Antifungal activity and identification of Lactobacilli, isolated from traditional dairy product "katak". *Anaerobe*. 2014;28:78–84. doi: 10.1016/j.anaerobe.2014.05.010. [PubMed: 24887637].
- 7. Khalid NM, Marth EH. Lactobacilli-their enzymes and role in ripening and spoilage of cheese: A review. *J Dairy Sci*. 1990;**73**(10):2669–84.
- Edalatian MR, Najafi MBH, Mortazavi SA, Alegria A, Nassiri MR, Bassami MR. Microbial diversity of the traditional Iranian cheeses Lighvan and Koozeh, as revealed by polyphasic culturing and cultureindependent approaches. *Dairy Sci Technol.* 2012;92(1):75–90.
- Iranmanesh M, Ezzatpanah H, Mojgani N, Torshizi MAK, Aminafshar M, Maohamadi M. Isolation of lactic acid bacteria from ewe milk traditional yoghurt and sour buttermilk in Iran. *Euro J Food Res Rev.* 2012;2(3):79–92.
- Najafi MZDH, Karimian A, Abedinia Nejad MH. Microbe ogica. Changes of Pousti Cheese During Ripening. Food Technology & Virition. 2011;8(2):85–92.
- Mannu L, Comunian R, Francesca Scintu M. Mesophi ic lactor cilli in Fiore Sardo cheese: PCR-identification and evolution during cheese ripening. *Int Dairy J.* 2000;10(5-6):387-9. doi:10.1016/s0958-6946(00)00074-1.
- Barrow GI, Feltham RKA. Cowan and Steeps manual fort bidentification of medical bacteria. Cam-bridge United angdom. Ambridge University Press; 1993. doi: 10.1017/cbo9. 511527. 4.
- Hashemi MT, Yavarmanesh M, Mila E, Pastan A. Effect of rennet type, container and riperarg proiod complysicochemical and microbial properties of log I Kradist cheese. Iran J Food Sci Technol. 2013;9(37):135-0.
- 14. Milani E. Feduation of synthess wordish cheese production using isolated native strains of the reliable of the synthesis of the synthesynthesis of the sy

- Torres-Lianez M, Vallejo-Cordoba B, Diaz-Cinco M, Mazorra-Manzano M, Gonzalez-Cordova A. Characterization of the natural microflora of artisanal Mexican Fresco cheese. *Food control.* 2006;**17**(9):683–90.
- Lourens-Hattingh A, Viljoen BC. Yogurt as probiotic carrier food. Int Dairy J. 2001;11(1):1–17.
- Jokovic N, Nikolic M, Begovic J, Jovcic B, Savic D, Topisirovic L. A survey of the lactic acid bacteria isolated from Serbian artisanal dairy product kajmak. *Int J Food Microbiol*. 2008;**127**(3):305–11. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2008.07.026. [PubMed: 18775578].
- Herreros M, Fresno J, Prieto MG, Tornadijo M. Technological characterization of lactic acid bacteria isolated from Armada cheese (a Spanish goats' milk cheese). *Int Dairy J.* 2003;13(6):469–79.
- Abdi R, Sheikh-Zeinoddin M, Soleimanian-Zad S. Identification of lactic acid bacteria isolated from traditional Iranian agny cheese. *Pakistan J Biologic Sci.* 2006;9(1):99–103. doi:10.3923 jbs.2006.9.103.
- Navidghasemizad S, Hesari J, Saris P, Navei M, solati h of lactic acid bacteria from Lighvan cheese, a semihar cheese and from raw sheep milk in Iran. Int J Dairy Technol 2009;62(2):60–4.
- 21. Durlu-Ozkaya F, Xanthopoolos V, Unail N, Vtopoulou-Tzanetaki E. Technologically important properties of lact - acid bacteria isolates from Beyaz cheese many zonn aw ewes milk. *J Appl Microbiol.* 2001;**91**(5):861-70. [PubMedia 72266
- Hassanzadazar H, Ebs. di A. Phototypic characterization of lactic acid bacteria isolated from taditionar koopeh cheese. *Global Veterinaria*. 2013;10(2):40-2
- 23. Manoloporou P. Cantinopoulos P, Zoidou E, Aktypis A, Moschopoulou F, Kandarakis IG, et al. Evolution of microbial populations during relational Feta cheese manufacture and ripening. *Int J rood Microbiol.* 203;**82**(2):153–61. [PubMed: 12568755].
- 24 Jubanda F, OWusu-Kwarteng J, Tano-Debrah K, Glover RL, Nielsen DS, Jenersen L. Taxonomic and molecular characterization of lactic acid b. veria and yeasts in nunu, a Ghanaian fermented milk prodt. *Pod Microbiol.* 2013;**34**(2):277–83. doi: 10.1016/j.fm.2012.09.025. [PubMed: 23541194].
- 25 Mathara JM, Schillinger U, Guigas C, Franz C, Kutima PM, Mbugua SK, et al. Functional characteristics of Lactobacillus spp. from traditional Maasai fermented milk products in Kenya. *Int J Food Microbiol.* 2008;**126**(1-2):57-64. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2008.04.027. [PubMed: 18539351].
- Yu J, Wang WH, Menghe BL, Jiri MT, Wang HM, Liu WJ, et al. Diversity of lactic acid bacteria associated with traditional fermented dairy products in Mongolia. J Dairy Sci. 2011;94(7):3229–41. doi: 10.3168/jds.2010-3727. [PubMed: 21700007].
- Rossetti L, Fornasari ME, Gatti M, Lazzi C, Neviani E, Giraffa G. Grana Padano cheese whey starters: microbial composition and strain distribution. *Int J Food Microbiol*. 2008;**127**(1-2):168–71. doi: 10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2008.06.005. [PubMed: 18620769].
- Garabal JI, Rodriguez-Alonso P, Centeno JA. Characterization of lactic acid bacteria isolated from raw cows' milk cheeses currently produced in Galicia (NW Spain). *Food Sci Technol*. 2008;**41**(8):1452–8. doi: 10.1016/j.lwt.2007.09.004.