

# Advantages and Challenges of Telecardiology and Providing Solutions for Its Successful Implementation: A Scoping Review

Nasim Aslani <sup>1</sup>, PhD;<sup>®</sup> Ali Garavand <sup>1,\*</sup>, PhD;<sup>®</sup> Saeed Jelvay <sup>2</sup>, MSc; Masoumeh Maleki <sup>3</sup>, MSc; Mina Lazem <sup>4</sup>, PhD; Sadegh Sharafi <sup>2</sup>, BSc

<sup>1</sup>Department of Health Information Technology, School of Allied Medical Sciences, Lorestan University of Medical Sciences, Khorramabad, IR Iran
<sup>2</sup>Department of Health Information Technology, Abadan University of Medical Sciences, Abadan, IR Iran
<sup>3</sup>Department of Health Information Technology, School of Allied Medical Sciences, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, IR Iran
<sup>4</sup>Department of Health Information Management, School of Health Management and Information Sciences, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran

#### ARTICLE INFO

Article Type: Review Article

Article History: Received: 20 Dec 2021 Revised: 9 Feb 2022 Accepted: 21 Feb 2022

Keywords: Telemedicine Cardiology Cardiovascular Disease Wearable Electronic Devices

#### ABSTRACT

**Context:** Implementation of health information technologies such as telecardiology has always been associated with many challenges. Identifying these challenges and planning to address them can lead to success in their implementation. The present study aimed to identify the advantages and disadvantages of using telecardiology and to provide solutions for its successful implementation based on the obtained results.

**Evidence Acquisition:** This scoping review was conducted in 2021. A search was done in PubMed, Scopus, and Web of Science databases by combining the related keywords. The data were gathered using an excel sheet data extraction form after applying the article selection steps. Then, data analysis was done through the content analysis method and the results were summarized and reported based on the study objectives.

**Results:** Totally, 30 articles were included in the study based on the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The advantages of telecardiology were divided into eight main categories, namely facilitating healthcare providing processes, medical education, healthcare quality, increasing Health Care Providers' (HCP) performance, reducing costs, availability and accessibility of healthcare services, data management, and patient monitoring. Additionally, the challenges of telecardiology implementation were classified into six categories; i.e., economic and financial difficulties, the nature of heart disease, human resources, difficulties related to Information Technology (IT), wearable devices challenges, and uncertainty of results.

**Conclusion**: Telecardiology systems are recommended to be used more to provide healthcare services to remote and rural areas as well as those with a lack of specialists. Due to the challenges facing the successful implementation of telecardiology, preliminary studies such as feasibility studies and acceptance and initial pre-implementation evaluations are warranted.

# 1. Context

Heart diseases are one of the most important causes of death worldwide (1). Access to healthcare services from initial to advanced levels can reduce the death rate amongst patients with heart diseases, especially in remote areas (2). However, providing healthcare services for patients in remote areas without specialists, particularly in cardiac care, has created significant challenges in the health system (3). The high sensitivity of providing high-quality and timely healthcare services for patients with cardiovascular disease has led managers and healthcare providers to consider using information technology to provide these services (4-6).

The use of telemedicine has been found to facilitate the provision of health services in remote areas and to pave the way for equity in health (7). The World Health Organization (WHO) has defined telemedicine as the provision of healthcare services by specialists through the transmission of information about the diagnosis, prevention, and treatment of diseases and other health-related problems (8). Telemedicine is, in fact, a supportive tool for providing a wide range of health services based on information technology innovations (9). Nowadays, many telemedicine

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author: Ali Garavand, Department of Health Information Technology, School of Allied Medical Sciences, Lorestan University of Medical Sciences, Khorramabad, Iran. Cellphone: +98-9165604942, Email: virya67@yahoo.com.

services, from teleconsulting to telesurgery, are available for healthcare providers (10). One of these technologies is telecardiology, which is a type of telemedicine providing healthcare services. It includes diagnostic and treatment procedures for patients with heart diseases such as Heart Failure (HF), Coronary Artery Disease (CAD), and Congenital Heart Disease (CHD) by a remote clinician by using information technologies such as videoconferencing (11). Telecardiology facilitates communication between different centers and provides specialized services and cardiac counseling (11). In some cases, sending an ontime Electrocardiography (ECG) result to a cardiologist and providing the necessary initial intervention based on the ECG interpretation can save a patient's life. This will be possible by relying on the basic capabilities of telecardiology (12). In advanced levels of telecardiology, it is also possible to perform ECG using newly designed tools such as smartwatches or implantable devices in the patient's body. Besides, some technologies such as the Global Positioning System (GPS) can send these results to the relevant centers to provide appropriate healthcare services to patients (11). Furthermore, this technology can be used to train novice physicians and receive specialized consultations from healthcare providers (13, 14). In addition to facilitating the provision of specialized healthcare services (15) and improving the health of at-risk people for heart diseases, the use of telecardiology can significantly reduce costs (16, 17). For instance, in cases with minimal facilities and without a specialized cardiac center in remote areas, telecardiology can provide proper specialized services for patients, which can save up to several thousand dollars (18, 19).

Developing, implementing, and using telecardiology has many advantages. Similar to other technologies, however, it can be associated with many challenges. Therefore, many studies and projects in telecardiology have been conducted in recent years. Yeo et al. conducted a study in 2019 and showed that despite the many benefits of this technology, its high cost was one of the main challenges of its implementation (20). In another study done by Maia et al. in 2019, using telepediatric to provide cardiac care services enabled real-time communication, clinical information sharing, and provision of healthcare services in distant and local sites (21).

The present study aims to assess the benefits and challenges of using telecardiology for providing healthcare services to patients with cardiovascular disease. The study results can be used as a practical guide for policymakers and managers by identifying the benefits and challenges of implementing telecardiology and providing solutions for its implementation.

# 2. Evidence Acquisition

#### 2.1. Study Design

This scoping review was conducted based on scoping review and systematic review guidelines in 2021 (22, 23). Generally, scoping reviews have three main parts, namely Population, Context, and Concept (PCC) (22, 23). Therefore, the study method was formulated based on these parts.

#### 2.2. Search Strategy and Study Selection

A search was conducted in PubMed, Scopus, and

Web of Science databases to find studies in English without time limitation by combining the following keywords: ("telecardiology" OR "tele-ECG" OR "tele echocardiography" OR "tele-CCU" OR "tele emergency") AND ("Advantages" OR "disadvantages" OR "adoption" OR "challenge" OR "barrier" OR "problem" OR "facilitator" OR "strategy").

# 2.3. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

The original articles about the advantages and challenges of telecardiology were selected. The chosen studies implemented telecardiology services for cardiovascular disease or assessed implemented projects. The studies that did not evaluate the advantages and challenges of telecardiology in implemented projects were excluded. Other article types than original articles, those that were not about telecardiology implementation, and those without an English full text were excluded, as well.

# 2.4. Data Extraction

Data extraction was done by two authors, and the disagreements were forwarded to the project manager. A data extraction form was utilized for extracting data from the selected studies. The data extraction form contained four main parts; i.e., article bibliometric data, methodological information, advantages and challenges, and results.

## 2.5. Data Analysis

Data analyses were done through content analysis, and the results were summarized and reported in form of tables and figures based on the study objectives.

# 3. Results

From the 177 articles found in the first step, 30 studies were included after applying the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The process of article selection based on the PRISMA flowchart has been depicted in Figure 1.



Figure 1. Article Selection Process based on the PRISMA Flowchart

The features of the selected studies have been presented in Table 1. Accordingly, the first article was conducted in 2009. Additionally, 73.33% of the articles (22 out of the 30 studies) were about telecardiology projects implementation.

| Tab | Table 1. The Features of the Included Studies |                           |  |  |                                  |   |  |  |
|-----|---|---------------------------|--|--|----------------------------------|---|--|--|
|     | First author                                  | Level of Use              | Type of Use  | Participants   | Type of                          | Type of Disease   |  |  |
|     | Year  |                           |  | (Main Emphasis)  | Telecardiology                   |   |  |  |
| 1   | Country<br>Blazek, 2016                       | Implementation            | Monitoring   | Dhusiciano   | Talamanitaring                   | Cardianappiratany   |  |  |
| 1   | Switzerland (24)                              |                           | Monitoring   | Physicians   | Telemonitoring                   | Cardiorespiratory<br>monitoring                                       |  |  |
| 2   | Hansen, 2020<br>Norway (25)                   | Implementation            | ECG interpretation   | Nurses   | Tele-ECG                         | Heart failure   |  |  |
| 3   | Cuneo, 2019<br>USA (26)                       | Implementation            | Risk stratification of fetal cardiac<br>anomalies in an underserved<br>population  | Physicians and patients  | Telecardiology                   | Fetal cardiac anomalies<br>(CHF, arrhythmia)                          |  |  |
| 4   | Makkar, 2021<br>USA (27)                      | Implementation            | Congenital heart disease<br>screening in a level II neonatal<br>intensive care unit  | Physicians   | Tele-ECG                         | Congenital heart disease  |  |  |
| 5   | Hsieh, 2012<br>Taiwan (28)                    | Implementation            | A model for tele-ECG implementation  | Cardiologists  | Tele-ECG                         | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 6   | Behere, 2019<br>USA (29)                      | Assessment                | Evaluation of tele-auscultation system   | Cardiologists  | Tele-auscultation                | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 7   | Mattos, 2020<br>Brazil (30)                   | Implementation            | Screening congenital heart<br>disease  | Pediatricians  | Telecardiology                   | Congenital heart disease  |  |  |
| 8   | Shetty, 2017<br>India (31)                    | Feasibility study         | Connecting to a rural area   | Cardiologist, staff  | Telecardiology                   | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 9   | Finley, 2021<br>USA (32)                      | Initial<br>implementation | Comparison of the use of<br>telecardiology services and<br>people who received regular<br>services                                       | Veterans   | Telecardiology for outpatients   | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 10  | Dwivedi, 2021<br>India (33)                   | Implementation            | Importance of imaging in work<br>up of cardiovascular disease by<br>using telemedicine in rural India                                    | Physicians   | Telecardiology/<br>teleradiology | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 11  | Lacerda, 2014<br>Brazil (34)                  | Assessment                | Comparative evaluation of the<br>applicability of two approaches<br>for reporting findings in the field<br>of large-scale telecardiology | Physicians   | Tele-<br>electrocardiography     | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 12  | Rosier, 2016<br>France (35)                   | Implementation            | Remote monitoring of cardiac<br>implantable electronic devices<br>such as pacemakers and<br>defibrillators                               | -  | Telemonitoring                   | Cardiac implantable<br>electronic devices                             |  |  |
| 13  | Bonis, 2021<br>Italy (36)                     | Assessment                | Management of STEMI diagnosis during the COVID-19 pandemic   | Physicians   | Tele-ECG                         | STEMI   |  |  |
| 14  | Maines, 2021<br>Italy (37)                    | Implementation            | Remote follow-up of pacemakers<br>and implantable cardiac<br>defibrillators  | -  | Telemonitoring                   | Patients with pacemakers<br>and implantable cardiac<br>defibrillators |  |  |
| 15  | Maia M.R.<br>2019<br>Portugal (21)            | Implementation            | Pediatric cardiology service   | Pediatrician   | Pediatric cardiology service     | Pediatric care  |  |  |
| 16  | Jatmiko, 2019<br>Indonesia (38)               | Implementation            | Early detection and monitoring<br>of heart diseases based on the<br>ECG signal   |  | Tele-ECG                         | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 17  | Yeo, 2019<br>Malaysia (20)                    | Initial<br>assessment     | -  | Patients and<br>individuals who<br>used Internet<br>services in their<br>daily lives | Telecardiology                   | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 18  | Chauhan, 2018<br>India (39)                   | Implementation            | Tele-ECG support for primary<br>care physicians reduced the<br>pain-to-treatment time in acute<br>coronary syndrome                      | Primary care<br>physicians   | Tele-ECG                         | Acute coronary<br>syndrome  |  |  |
| 19  | Yeo, 2017<br>Malaysia (40)                    | Assessment                | -  | Cardiologists,<br>general physicians,<br>patients, and the<br>public                 | Telecardiology                   | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 20  | Brunetti, 2016<br>Italy (41)                  | Implementation            | Cardiovascular disease prevention with telecardiology  | Patients   | Telecardiology                   | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
| 21  | Scheuermeyer,<br>2016<br>Canada (42)          | Implementation            | Remote ECG report  | Physicians   | Tele-ECG                         | Cardiovascular disease  |  |  |
|     | . /   |                           |  |  |                                  |   |  |  |

| 22 | Bansal, 2015<br>India (43)       | Implementation | Training based on tele-ECG   | Physicians              | Tele-ECG  | Cardiovascular disease                |
|----|----------------------------------|----------------|--|-------------------------|---|---------------------------------------|
| 23 | Bendelac, 2014<br>France (44)    | Implementation | Ambulatory monitoring of patients with heart failure   | Physicians              | Remote monitoring                                   | Heart failure                         |
| 24 | Rushworth, 2014<br>UK (45)       | Implementation | Pre-hospital ECG E-transmission for myocardial infarction  | Physicians and nurses   | Telecardiology                                      | Myocardial infarction                 |
| 25 | Khader, 2014<br>Jordan (46)      | Implementation | Impact of live interactive<br>telecardiology on diagnosis and<br>disease management, patients'<br>quality of life, and time- and<br>cost-savings | Patients                | Telecardiology                                      | Cardiovascular disease                |
| 26 | Moreau, 2014<br>France (47)      | Implementation | Follow-up of implanted cardioverter defibrillators   | Patients                | Remote monitoring                                   | Implanted cardioverter defibrillators |
| 27 | Theuns, 2012<br>Netherlands (48) | Implementation | The management of system-<br>related complications in<br>implantable defibrillator patients  | Patients                | Remote monitoring                                   | Implantable defibrillator patients    |
| 28 | Antonicelli, 2010<br>Italy (49)  | Implementation | Telemonitoring on use of $\beta$ -blockers in congestive heart failure   | Physicians/<br>patients | Telemonitoring,<br>telecardiology                   | Congestive heart failure              |
| 29 | Pappas, 2010<br>UK (50)          | Implementation | Physical examination in<br>telecardiology and televascular<br>consultations  | Physicians/<br>patients | Telecardiology<br>and televascular<br>consultations | Cardiovascular disease                |
| 30 | Giordano, 2009<br>Italy (51)     | Implementation | Tele-management to prevent<br>hospital readmission of patients<br>with chronic heart failure   | Physicians/<br>patients | Telecardiology/<br>telecardiology                   | Chronic heart failure                 |

Abbreviations: STEMI, ST-elevation myocardial infarction; CHF, chronic heart failure; ECG, electrocardiography



**Figure 2.** The Frequency of Using Telecardiology in the Studies Based on the Type of Heart Disease

Based on Table 1, most studies were conducted in India (four articles) and the USA (four articles). The results also showed that healthcare services based on telecardiology were provided for different types of heart disease. However, many studies included interventions for cardiovascular disease (Figure 2).

The results indicated that telemedicine and telecardiology were the most frequent keywords in the selected articles. The occurrence network of the keywords in different years has been shown in Figure 3, with the topics of interest being marked with a specific color.

The study results revealed the main advantages (eight main categories) and challenges (five main categories) of telecardiology (Table 2).



Figure 3. The Occurrence Network of the Keywords

| Table 2. The | Table 2. The Advantages and Challenges of Telecardiology for Providing Healthcare Services |   |                  |  |  |  |  |
|--------------|--|---|------------------|--|--|--|--|
| Advantages/  | Categories   | Subcategories   | References       |  |  |  |  |
| Challenges   |  |   |                  |  |  |  |  |
| Advantages   |  | Simplifying the workflow (Tele-ECG)   | (25)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | provision processes  | Facilitating the performance of ultrasonography by staff (Telecardiology)                               | (26)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Providing timely ECG interpretation and counseling to patients (Telecardiology)                         | (31)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Effectiveness in the diagnosis and treatment of patients in rural areas (Telecardiology, Teleradiology) | (33)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Fast diagnosis and triage (Tele-ECG, Telecardiology, Telemonitoring)                                    | (45, 48, 52)     |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | A useful screening tool for murmur evaluation (Tele-auscultation)                                       | (29)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Supporting the treatment plan (Telecardiology)  | (46)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Preventing unnecessary device replacement (Telemonitoring)  | (48)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Assistance in determining the appropriate dose of beta-blockers (Telemonitoring, Telecardiology)        | (49)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Optimizing the use of various drugs (Telemonitoring, Telecardiology)                                    | (49)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Medical education  | Increasing pediatricians' understanding of echocardiography (Telecardiology)                            | (30)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Educating physicians in terms of ECG (Tele-ECG)   | (43)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Extensive education for patients with heart failure (Telemonitoring)                                    | (44)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Healthcare quality   | Accurate, safe, and effective in CHD screening (Tele-ECG)   | (27)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Increasing healthcare services efficiency (Tele-ECG)  | (28)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Improving the prevention of the complications of cardiovascular disease (Telecardiology)                | (41)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Improve patients' quality of life (Telecardiology)  | (46)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Increasing HCPs'   | Ability to provide a standard of care without the need for patient attendance (Telecardiology)          | (26)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | performance  | Ease of use (Tele-auscultation, Tele-ECG)   | (29, 39)         |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Ensuring the continuity of patient monitoring (Telemonitoring)  | (37)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Increasing the participation of primary care nurses (Telecardiology, Televascular consultations)        | (50)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Reducing costs   | Appropriate economic benefits for families (Telecardiology)   | (26)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Saving transfer costs (Tele-ECG)  | (27)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Significant cost reduction (Tele-ECG, Telemonitoring)   | (28, 39, 47, 51) |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Reducing the readmission of patients in hospitals and saving costs (Telecardiology)                     | (51)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Availability and   | Providing healthcare services in distant and local sites (Telecardiology, Tele-pediatric)               | (21, 26)         |  |  |  |  |
|              | accessibility of<br>healthcare services  | Preventing the unnecessary transfer of most infants to regional level III/IV NICUs (Tele-<br>ECG)       | (27)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | High-quality ECGs successfully received by rural clinical staff (Telecardiology)                        | (31)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Addressing a part of the need for specialized physicians in disadvantaged areas (Tele-pediatric)        | (21)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Reduction of waiting time (Telecardiology)  | (20)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Reduction of unnecessary transfers (Telecardiology)   | (20)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Facilitating healthcare services in rural areas (Telecardiology)  | (20)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Improving patient-physician relationships (Telecardiology)  | (45)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Data management  | Intangible data acquisition (Telemonitoring)  | (24)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Possibility to calculate the received oxygen (Telemonitoring)   | (24)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Transfer of imaging data (Tele-ECG)   | (25)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Improving data management (Tele-ECG)  | (28)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Enabling real-time communication and sharing of clinical information (Tele-pediatric)                   | (21)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Sharing information in a shorter time (Telecardiology, Tele-ECG)  | (20, 42)         |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Safe data sharing (Tele-ECG)  | (42)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Patient monitoring   | Evaluating vital signs in different body parts (Telemonitoring)   | (24, 48)         |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Long-term monitoring of physiological effects (Telemonitoring)  | (24)             |  |  |  |  |
| Challenges   | Economic and   | Facilitating patients' living conditions at home (Telemonitoring)<br>Social and economic issues         | (44)             |  |  |  |  |
| Chanenges    | financial challenges   | Reimbursement of regulation challenges  | (17)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | initiational childhonges   | High costs of implementing telecardiology devices   | (15)<br>(40)     |  |  |  |  |
|              | Human resources  | Resistance of healthcare providers and patients to accepting and using telecardiology                   | (40)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Fullan resources   | Preference of face-to-face counseling over virtual counseling   | (40)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | IT-related challenges  | Some problems in interoperability between devices   | (40)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | 11 Telated chancinges  | Difficult management of system alerts by increase in the number of alerts                               | (35)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Information confidentiality   | (40)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | Data transfer network problems  | (40)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Wearable devices   | Not applicable for sensitive skin   | (15, 24)         |  |  |  |  |
|              | challenges   | The size of wearable tools  | (15)             |  |  |  |  |
|              | Other  | Uncertainty of results  | (48)             |  |  |  |  |
|              |  | The severity of the disease   | (17)             |  |  |  |  |
| A11 1 41     | ECC alactrocardiography  |   | (1)              |  |  |  |  |

Abbreviations: ECG, electrocardiography; CHD, chronic heart disease; HCP, healthcare provider; NICU, neonatal intensive care unit; IT, information technology.

Based on the results, implementing telecardiology services had some challenges such as economic and financial challenges, the nature of heart disease, human resources, challenges related to information technology, and wearable devices challenges. The suggestions for implementing telecardiology services included assessing the acceptance of telecardiology services (17), use of technology acceptance models before implementing telecardiology (20), assessing the effectiveness (17), degree of patient adherence (25), training for use of the device (26, 44, 48, 52), and conducting more studies in the field (15). Other recommendations were establishing a telemedicine platform to ensure compatibility between different devices (15, 21), defining regulations and procedures for telecardiology services (15), defining reimbursement rules for different monitoring methods (15), minimizing external and internal devices for remote monitoring (32), introducing telecardiology to users to ensure successful implementation (32), and using telecardiology in educational interventions (50).

## 4. Discussion

Most of the articles chosen in the present study had implemented telecardiology projects. They pointed out the advantages and challenges of using these systems. Up to now, limited studies have been done on the challenges associated with the implementation of telecardiology. One of the most critical strategies for successful health information systems is to study the challenges and barriers of implementation and to perform initial evaluations of the implemented systems (53). Thus, to achieve better results from implementing telecardiology systems, further studies are warranted.

The present study results showed that few studies were conducted on the benefits and challenges of telecardiology in remote and rural areas, while there seem to be serious problems and challenges in the implementation of telemedicine projects in these areas due to their geographical location.

In cardiovascular patients, providing timely services is one of the main reasons for using telecardiology. In fact, patients should be provided with the necessary services in any place (urban or rural) and at any time based on monitoring and surveys (54). However, one of the main reasons for using telemedicine is to provide services to people in remote areas (55). Thus, attention should be paid to the identification of the challenges of providing telemedicine services to people in these areas. Telemedicine-based services can be used as a tool to implement equity in healthcare delivery, especially in remote areas with a lack of specialists (56). Based on the current study findings, no study was done on telecardiology and its benefits and challenges in many parts of the world. Hence, telecardiology projects are recommended to be considered in different countries, especially in those with a high prevalence of cardiovascular disease.

The occurrence network analysis of the study indicated a change in the trend of the studies in the recent years. Accordingly, telecardiology services have moved towards the use of new technologies such as smartwatches and artificial intelligence algorithms in monitoring and providing healthcare services for patients with cardiovascular disease. Nonetheless, using these new technologies in providing telecardiology services is still at the beginning levels. Therefore, further studies are required to be conducted to achieve success and to increase the acceptance of telemedicine services based on artificial intelligence (57).

The present study results demonstrated that the use of different types of telecardiology such as telemonitoring, tele-ECG, distance education, and remote cardiac counseling in providing health services to patients was accompanied by many benefits including facilitating healthcare provision processes, medical education, healthcare quality, increasing the performance of healthcare providers, reduction of costs, availability and accessibility of healthcare services, data management, and patient monitoring. In many cases, the use of telecardiology facilitated the provision of healthcare services for patients with cardiovascular disease. However, it cannot be certainly claimed that telecardiology can facilitate service provision for heart patients in all conditions. Yet, the use of this technology can facilitate the provision of services in remote areas with the lack of cardiologists. Simplifying the workflow (25), facilitating the performance of ultrasonography by staff (26), providing timely ECG interpretation and counseling to patients (31), effective diagnosis and treatment of patients in rural areas (33), and fast diagnosis and triage (48, 52) were some benefits of telecardiology in facilitating healthcare provision.

According to the present study results, given that telecardiology allows telecommunication between healthcare professionals, it can be used as an educational tool for educating inexperienced physicians and patients. However, there is disagreement amongst experts and policymakers about the financial benefits of telecardiology, with some pointing to the positive impact of reducing costs and some pointing to increased costs. In some cases, using the simple facilities of telecardiology, the need to set up some clinics and healthcare centers that require much money can be eliminated. The use of telecardiology services in remote and rural areas can also facilitate patient monitoring in these areas.

The current study findings indicated that despite the numerous benefits, the implementation of telecardiology systems might face challenges, which could affect their success. One of these challenges was related to economic and financial obstacles in project implementation (40). Thus, the cost-effectiveness of these systems is recommended to be assessed accurately. Another significant challenge in the telecardiology implementation was related to information and communication technology infrastructure (15), especially in developing countries and remote regions. Based on the results, developing countries can develop communication infrastructure, making it possible to expand the provision of services in all regions. Since many problems related to information technology result from the production of different systems and the difficulty of interacting between them, more studies have to be done on the interoperability of systems.

One of the most important strategies for successful implementation of telecardiology systems is assessing the acceptance of telecardiology services (17). The current study results showed that only one study was conducted on the factors affecting the acceptance of telecardiology based on technology acceptance models (20). Therefore, further studies are recommended to be carried out in this field. By minimizing the external and internal devices (implantable and wearable telemonitoring devices) for remote monitoring of cardiovascular disease, their usability can be increased. Introducing telecardiology potentials and abilities to users to ensure its successful implementation (32) is yet another strategy that can be used to implement telecardiology systems.

# 5. Conclusion

The study findings suggested further employment of telecardiology systems to provide healthcare services to remote and rural areas as well as those with a lack of specialists. Considering the challenges facing the successful implementation of telecardiology, preliminary studies such as feasibility studies and acceptance and initial pre-implementation evaluations are warranted. Moreover, regarding the financial issues associated with the implementation and continuation of using telecardiology, authorities should pay attention to supplying sustainable financial resources to provide these services. Further studies on the implementation, use, and evaluation of telecardiology systems are also suggested, because some studies have emphasized the need for future studies on the effects of telecardiology on the process of providing healthcare services. Combining information technologybased services with innovations in artificial intelligence is one of the new trends in the field of telecardiology that has been considered and used in recent years. These services can make telecardiology easier to use and reduce the costs. Therefore, more studies are recommended to be performed in this area.

## Acknowledgements

There is no acknowledgement.

#### **Authors' Contribution**

AG, NA, and SJ designed the study. AG and NA supervised the study. MM, ML, and AG prepared the preliminary draft of the manuscript. SJ and AG checked the clinical and technical aspects of the manuscript. SSH, ML, and MM revised the manuscript critically. All authors read and approved the final draft of the manuscript.

## **Funding/Support**

The authors have no funding/support related to the material in the manuscript.

# **Financial Disclosure**

The authors have no financial interests related to the material in the manuscript.

#### References

- Garavand A, Emami H, Rabiei R, Pishgahi M, Vahidi-Asl M. Designing the Coronary Artery Disease Registry with Data Management Processes Approach: A Comparative Systematic Review in Selected Registries. Int Cardio Res J. 2020;14(1):e100833.
- Thompson SC, Nedkoff L, Katzenellenbogen J, Hussain MA, Sanfilippo F. Challenges in Managing Acute Cardiovascular Diseases and Follow Up Care in Rural Areas: A Narrative Review.

Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2019;16(24).

- Sulemana A, Dinye RD. Access to healthcare in rural communities in Ghana: a study of some selected communities in the Pru District. European Journal of Research in Social Sciences. 2014;2(4).
- 4. Afzali M, Etemad K, Kazemi A, Rabiei R. Cerebral palsy information system with an approach to information architecture: a systematic review. BMJ Health Care Inform. 2019;26(1).
- Garavand A, Rabiei R, Emami H, Pishgahi M, Vahidi-Asl M. The attributes of hospital-based coronary artery diseases registries with a focus on key registry processes: A systematic review. Health Information Management Journal. 2020 17:1833358320929366.
- Sabahi A, Ahmadian L, Mirzaee M. Communicating laboratory results through a Web site: Patients' priorities and viewpoints. J Clin Lab Anal. 2018;32(6):e22422.
- Haleem A, Javaid M, Singh RP, Suman R. Telemedicine for healthcare: Capabilities, features, barriers, and applications. Sens Int. 2021;2:100117.
- Organization WH. Telemedicine: opportunities and developments in member states. Report on the second global survey on eHealth: World Health Organization; 2010.
- Escobar OR, Leone D, Malafronte P, Mele S. The effect of telemedicine on patients' wellbeing: A systematic review. Journal of Innovation Economics Management. 2021:198-23.
- McMaster T, Wright T, Mori K, Stelmach W, To H. Current and future use of telemedicine in surgical clinics during and beyond COVID-19: A narrative review. Ann Med Surg (Lond). 2021;66:102378.
- Backman W, Bendel D, Rakhit R. The telecardiology revolution: improving the management of cardiac disease in primary care. J R Soc Med. 2010;103(11):442-6.
- 12. Brunetti ND, Di Pietro G, Aquilino A, Bruno AI, Dellegrottaglie G, Di Giuseppe G, et al. Pre-hospital electrocardiogram triage with tele-cardiology support is associated with shorter time-to-balloon and higher rates of timely reperfusion even in rural areas: data from the Bari- Barletta/Andria/Trani public emergency medical service 118 registry on primary angioplasty in ST-elevation myocardial infarction. Eur Heart J Acute Cardiovasc Care. 2014;3(3):204-13.
- 13. Isakadze N, Martin SS. How useful is the smartwatch ECG? Trends Cardiovasc Med. 2020;30(7):442-8.
- Rad MZ, Ghuchani SR, Bahaadinbeigy K, Khalilzadeh MM. Real Time Recognition of Heart Attack in a Smart Phone. Acta Inform Med. 2015;23(3):151-4.
- 15. Piotrowicz E. The management of patients with chronic heart failure: the growing role of e-Health. Expert Rev Med Devices. 2017;14(4):271-7.
- Kraai I, de Vries A, Vermeulen K, van Deursen V, van der Wal M, de Jong R, et al. The value of telemonitoring and ICT-guided disease management in heart failure: Results from the IN TOUCH study. Int J Med Inform. 2016;85(1):53-60.
- 17. Piotrowicz E, Piepoli MF, Jaarsma T, Lambrinou E, Coats AJ, Schmid JP, et al. Telerehabilitation in heart failure patients: The evidence and the pitfalls. Int J Cardiol. 2016;220:408-13.
- Sekar P, Vilvanathan V. Telecardiology: effective means of delivering cardiac care to rural children. Asian Cardiovasc Thorac Ann. 2007;15(4):320-3.
- Nejadshafiee M, Bahaadinbeigy K, Kazemi M, Nekoei-Moghadam M. Telenursing in Incidents and Disasters: A Systematic Review of the Literature. J Emerg Nurs. 2020;46(5):611-22.
- Yeo KJ, Al-Ashwal RHA, Handayani L, Lee SH. Healthcare receivers' acceptance of telecardiology in Malaysia. TELKOMNIKA (Telecommunication Computing Electronics and Control). 2019;17(3):1128-35.
- Maia MR, Castela E, Pires A, Lapão LV. How to develop a sustainable telemedicine service? A Pediatric Telecardiology Service 20 years on - an exploratory study. BMC Health Serv Res. 2019;19(1):681.
- Peters MD, Godfrey CM, Khalil H, McInerney P, Parker D, Soares CB. Guidance for conducting systematic scoping reviews. Int J Evid Based Healthc. 2015;13(3):141-6.
- Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. Ann Intern Med. 2018;169(7):467-73.
- Blazek V, Blanik N, Blazek CR, Paul M, Pereira C, Koeny M, et al. Active and Passive Optical Imaging Modality for Unobtrusive Cardiorespiratory Monitoring and Facial Expression Assessment. Anesth Analg. 2017;124(1):104-19.
- 25. Hjorth-Hansen AK, Andersen GN, Graven T, Gundersen GH,

Kleinau JO, Mjølstad OC, et al. Feasibility and Accuracy of Tele-Echocardiography, With Examinations by Nurses and Interpretation by an Expert via Telemedicine, in an Outpatient Heart Failure Clinic. J Ultrasound Med. 2020;39(12):2313-23.

- Cuneo BF, Olson CA, Haxel C, Howley L, Gagnon A, Benson DW, et al. Risk Stratification of Fetal Cardiac Anomalies in an Underserved Population Using Telecardiology. Obstet Gynecol. 2019;134(5):1096-103.
- 27. Makkar A, Milsten J, McCoy M, Szyld EG, Lapadula MC, Ganguly A, et al. Tele-Echocardiography for Congenital Heart Disease Screening in a Level II Neonatal Intensive Care Unit with Hybrid Telemedicine System. Telemed J E Health. 2021;27(10):1136-42.
- Hsieh JC, Hsu MW. A cloud computing based 12-lead ECG telemedicine service. BMC Med Inform Decis Mak. 2012;12:77.
- Behere S, Baffa JM, Penfil S, Slamon N. Real-World Evaluation of the Eko Electronic Teleauscultation System. Pediatr Cardiol. 2019;40(1):154-60.
- Mattos SDS, Moser L, Diogenes TCP, Severi R, de Araújo JSS, Albuquerque FCL, et al. Echocardiography Learning by Pediatricians While Screening Congenital Heart Disease with the Aid of Telemedicine. Telemed J E Health. 2020;26(12):1449-54.
- Shetty R, Samant J, Nayak K, Maiya M, Reddy S. Feasibility of Telecardiology Solution to Connect Rural Health Clinics to a Teaching Hospital. Indian J Community Med. 2017;42(3):170-3.
- 32. Finley BA, Palitsky R, Charteris E, Pacheco C, Kapoor D. Outpatient telecardiology perceptions among rural, suburban, and urban veterans utilizing in-person cardiology versus telecardiology services: A mixed methods analysis. J Rural Health. 2021;37(4):812-20.
- Dwivedi S, Sharma V, Roy K. Importance of Imaging in Work up of Cardiovascular Diseases by Using Telemedicine in Rural India. J Assoc Physicians India. 2021;69(11):11-2.
- Lacerda TC, von Wangenheim CG, von Wangenheim A, Giuliano I. Does the use of structured reporting improve usability? A comparative evaluation of the usability of two approaches for findings reporting in a large-scale telecardiology context. J Biomed Inform. 2014;52:222-30.
- 35. Rosier A, Mabo P, Temal L, Van Hille P, Dameron O, Deléger L, et al. Personalized and automated remote monitoring of atrial fibrillation. Europace. 2016;18(3):347-52.
- 36. De Bonis S, Salerno N, Bisignani A, Capristo A, Sosto G, Verta A, et al. COVID-19 and STEMI: The role of telecardiology in the management of STEMI diagnosis during COVID 19 pandemic. Int J Cardiol Heart Vasc. 2021;32:100720.
- 37. Maines M, Tomasi G, Moggio P, Poian L, Peruzza F, Catanzariti D, et al. Scheduled versus alert transmissions for remote follow-up of cardiac implantable electronic devices: Clinical relevance and resource consumption. Int J Cardiol. 2021;334:49-54.
- Jatmiko W, Ma'sum MA, Wisesa HA, Sanabila HR. Developing smart Tele-ECG system for early detection and monitoring heart diseases based on ECG signal: progress and challenges. International Journal on Smart Sensing & Intelligent Systems. 2019;12(1).
- Chauhan V, Negi PC, Raina S, Raina S, Bhatnagar M, Guleri R, et al. Smartphone-based tele-electrocardiography support for primary care physicians reduces the pain-to-treatment time in acute coronary syndrome. J Telemed Telecare. 2018;24(8):540-6.
- Yeo K-J, Handayani L, Satria H, Shih-Hui L, Yap C-K. Barriers and Challenges to Telecardiology Adoption in Malaysia Context. International Journal of Electrical and Computer Engineering. 2017;7(1):260.
- Brunetti ND, Lanzone S, Dellegrottaglie G, Di Giuseppe G, De Gennaro L, Novielli V, et al. The CAPITAL study (CArdiovascular Prevention wIth Telecardiology in ApuLia): preliminary results. J

Cardiovasc Med (Hagerstown). 2016;17(7):455-61.

- 42. Scheuermeyer FX, Grunau BE, Findlay T, Grafstein E, Christenson J, Lang E, et al. Speed and accuracy of text-messaging emergency department electrocardiograms from a small community hospital to a provincial referral center. J Telemed Telecare. 2016;22(2):105-13.
- Bansal M, Singh S, Maheshwari P, Adams D, McCulloch ML, Dada T, et al. Value of interactive scanning for improving the outcome of new-learners in transcontinental tele-echocardiography (VISIONin-Tele-Echo) study. J Am Soc Echocardiogr. 2015;28(1):75-87.
- 44. Bendelac H, Pathak A, Molinier L, Ruidavets J-B, Mayère A, Berry M, et al. Optimization of ambulatory monitoring of patients with heart failure using telecardiology (OSICAT). European Research in Telemedicine/La Recherche Européenne en Télémédecine. 2014;3(4):161-7.
- 45. Rushworth GF, Bloe C, Diack HL, Reilly R, Murray C, Stewart D, et al. Pre-hospital ECG E-transmission for patients with suspected myocardial infarction in the highlands of Scotland. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2014;11(2):2346-60.
- 46. Khader YS, Jarrah MI, Al-Shudifat AE, Shdaifat A, Aljanabi H, Al-Fakeh SI, et al. Telecardiology application in jordan: its impact on diagnosis and disease management, patients' quality of life, and time- and cost-savings. Int J Telemed Appl. 2014;2014:819837.
- 47. Guédon-Moreau L, Lacroix D, Sadoul N, Clémenty J, Kouakam C, Hermida JS, et al. Costs of remote monitoring vs. ambulatory follow-ups of implanted cardioverter defibrillators in the randomized ECOST study. Europace. 2014;16(8):1181-8.
- Theuns DA, Jordaens L. Use of remote monitoring in the management of system-related complications in implantable defibrillator patients. Neth Heart J. 2012;20(2):82-5.
- Antonicelli R, Mazzanti I, Abbatecola AM, Parati G. Impact of home patient telemonitoring on use of β-blockers in congestive heart failure. Drugs Aging. 2010;27(10):801-5.
- Pappas Y, Seale C. The physical examination in telecardiology and televascular consultations: a study using conversation analysis. Patient Educ Couns. 2010;81(1):113-8.
- Giordano A, Scalvini S, Zanelli E, Corrà U, Longobardi GL, Ricci VA, et al. Multicenter randomised trial on home-based telemanagement to prevent hospital readmission of patients with chronic heart failure. Int J Cardiol. 2009;131(2):192-9.
- 52. Lazarus G, Kirchner HL, Siswanto BB. Prehospital teleelectrocardiographic triage improves the management of acute coronary syndrome in rural populations: A systematic review and meta-analysis. J Telemed Telecare. 2020:1357633x20960627.
- 53. Rahimi B, Nadri H, Lotfnezhad Afshar H, Timpka T. A Systematic Review of the Technology Acceptance Model in Health Informatics. Appl Clin Inform. 2018;9(3):604-34.
- Battineni G, Sagaro GG, Chintalapudi N, Amenta F. The Benefits of Telemedicine in Personalized Prevention of Cardiovascular Diseases (CVD): A Systematic Review. J Pers Med. 2021;11(7).
- Doorenbos AZ, Kundu A, Eaton LH, Demiris G, Haozous EA, Towle C, et al. Enhancing access to cancer education for rural healthcare providers via telehealth. J Cancer Educ. 2011;26(4):682-6.
- 56. Stawicki SP, Jeanmonod R, Miller AC, Paladino L, Gaieski DF, Yaffee AQ, et al. The 2019-2020 Novel Coronavirus (Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2) Pandemic: A Joint American College of Academic International Medicine-World Academic Council of Emergency Medicine Multidisciplinary COVID-19 Working Group Consensus Paper. J Glob Infect Dis. 2020;12(2):47-93.
- 57. Kuziemsky C, Maeder AJ, John O, Gogia SB, Basu A, Meher S, et al. Role of Artificial Intelligence within the Telehealth Domain. Yearb Med Inform. 2019;28(1):35-40.