Gene, Cell and Tissue
Volume 9 · Issue 1 · e117543

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Effects of Different Solvents to Extract Phytochemical Materials of *Rhazya stricta* Against *Salmonella typhimurium* Activity

Bahman Fazeli-Nasab, Hassan Ahmadi, Mehrangiz Ghafari

SUBMITTED	REVISED	ACCEPTED	DOI
3 Jul 2021	3 Aug 2021	22 Aug 2021	10.5812/gct.117543

About this report

This open peer review (OPR) report shows the public comments made on this article during peer review, by the reviewers, the associate editor and the editor-in-chief, for every revision round, together with the authors' replies. Comments appear only with the consent of the people who wrote them. Reviewers who chose to sign their report are named; the others are shown as "Referee". Comments are edited for language only, and confidential remarks to the editors are not included.

More about open peer review: brieflands.com/knowledgebase/opr

Contents

1 **Original submission** Referee 1, Associate Editor, Editor-in-Chief 2

2 **Revision 1** Referee 1, Associate Editor, Editor-in-Chief 3

Authors' reply to reviewers 4

Reviewer and editor comments 6

1 Original submission

3 comments · 18 Jul 2021 – 31 Jul 2021

Referee 1 Reviewer

MINOR REVISION 18 Jul 2021

In this work, the authors assessed the antimicrobial activity of Rhazya stricta extracts prepared with different solvents against Salmonella typhimurium. The manuscript is written. Still, the authors need to address the following concerns:
- Why did the authors examine different extracts (i.e., aqueous, ethanolic, hydroalcoholic, methanolic, and ethyl acetate extracts)? Is there evidence supporting the hypothesis that changing the solvent used to prepare the extract alters its biological activity? Why do different extracts of the same species have different antibacterial properties? Would you please discuss this?
- How did the authors calculate MIC and MBC? Would you please mention the formula used?
- The conclusion is too short and needs to be extended.
- Please discuss the following papers in the Discussion.
Ghanem Nevine B. Study on the antimicrobial activity of honey products and some Saudi Folkloric substances. Research Journal of Biotechnology. 2011 Nov;6(4):38-43.
Ahmad S, Fatima K. Antibacterial activity of Pakistani Rhazya stricta. Biological Sciences-PJSIR. 2004 Feb 23;47(1):29-33.
Hameed SS, ElAssouli MZ, Alhejin AM, Alam MZ, ElAssouli SM, Filimban FZ. Evaluation of genotoxicity and mutagenicity of aqueous extracts of Rhazya stricta Decne. and Thymus vulgaris L. Oriental Pharmacy and Experimental Medicine. 2018 Dec;18(4):357-63.

Associate Editor

MINOR REVISION 30 Jul 2021

Dear editor
The manuscript needs minor revision.
Best

Editor-in-Chief

MINOR REVISION 31 Jul 2021

Based on the reviewers' comments and my reading of the manuscript, minor revisions to the manuscript and a point-by-point response to the comments are needed.

2

Revision 1

AUTHORS' RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS

Authors' reply to reviewers

The next pages contain the authors' point-by-point reply to the comments of this revision round, as submitted with the revised manuscript. It is published as the authors wrote it.

Dear editor in chief

Thanks for reviewing of our article

The article was revised based on the reviewer's comments and the revised texts were highlighted by yellow color and are listed in the article text

Authors

2021-08-02

Reviewer 1:

In this work, the authors assessed the antimicrobial activity of Rhazya stricta extract prepared with different solvents against Salmonella typhimurium. The manuscript is written. Still, the authors are needed to address the following concerns:

- Why did the authors examine different extracts (i.e., Aqueous, ethanolic, hydroalcoholic, methanolic, and ethyl acetate extracts)? Is there evidence supporting the hypothesis that changing the solvent of the extract alters its biological activity? Why do different extracts of the same species have different antibacterial properties? Would you please discuss it?

Due to the fact that different solvents have different ability to extract specific types and amounts of phytochemicals of plants. Therefore, in this research, different types of solvents were tested. In addition to investigating the ability of solvents, in extracting phytochemicals, the antimicrobial ability of medicinal plants should also be investigated, which medicinal plant with the help of which solvent can be effective on which microbe.

- How did the authors calculate MIC and MBC? Would you please mention the used formula?

It was performed in 96 house microplate using microdilution method. The first step is to diagnose ocular mic and mbc. The second stage is the cultivation of wells. Once identified visually, culture is prepared from the wells.

- The conclusion is too short and needs to be extended.

This section was revised

- Please discuss the following paper in the Discussion.

Ghanem Nevine B. Study on the antimicrobial activity of honey products and some Saudi Folkloric substances. Research Journal of Biotechnology. 2011 Nov;6(4):38-43.

Ahmad S, Fatima K. Antibacterial activity of Pakistani Rhazya stricta. Biological Sciences-PJSIR. 2004 Feb 23;47(1):29-33.

Hameed SS, ElAssouli MZ, Alhejin AM, Alam MZ, ElAssouli SM, Filimban FZ. Evaluation of genotoxicity and mutagenicity of aqueous extracts of Rhazya stricta Decne. and Thymus vulgaris L. Oriental Pharmacy and Experimental Medicine. 2018 Dec;18(4):357-63.

The information of these references were used in the discussion section

Reviewer 2:
Dear editor manuscript is good and I give some comments
1- Please check the English
The English of this article was revised
2- Rewrite the text of Figure 2 it is not suitable
This section was revised

2 Revision 1

3 comments · 10 Aug 2021 – 22 Aug 2021

Referee 1 Reviewer

ACCEPT 10 Aug 2021

The manuscript is well revised and is now suitable for publication in GCT.

Associate Editor

ACCEPT 14 Aug 2021

Dear editor
The article is suitable for publication now.
Best regards

Editor-in-Chief

ACCEPT 22 Aug 2021

Based on the reviewer's and AE's comments, the revisions were done well. Thus, this manuscript can be accepted for publication in GCT.