OPEN PEER REVIEW

Open Peer Review (OPR)

As a new feature for progressing towards transparency, we decided to open a new window for all of our editors as well as authors titled "**Open Peer Review**". We hope by this new facility, our reviewers will be more motivated and authors will be more satisfied with the review process. We believe that publishing our peer review reports could make a transparent and clear environment for all our efforts within a journal, but not all reviewers tend to publish their comments.

What is "Open Peer Review" process?

An "Open Peer Review" process is making the details of all review process (including reviewers, associate editors, and EICs comments) as "Public" as it is agreed by EIC, Authors, and reviewers.

Advantages of "Open Peer Review" process

- More transparency, constructiveness and tactful comments of the peer review process: leads to an increase in the quality of reviews
- More motivations for all involved roles in the review process
- Authors' satisfactions from the review process: Increases honesty between authors and reviewers
- Education of both authors and new students
- Prevents reviewers from following their individual agendas and leading to the detection of reviewers' conflicts of interests

You can find out more at:
https://sites.kowsarpub.com/kowsar/knowledgebase/category/tree.html#opr.html

International Journal of Endocrinology and Metabolism
Article DOI: 10.5812/ijem.107641
Published in: International Journal of Endocrinology and Metabolism: 18(4); e107641

Peer Review Report for "Effect of Ramadan Fasting on Body Composition, Biochemical Profile, and Antioxidant Status in a Sample of Healthy Individuals"

Author(s): Asna Urooj, Namratha Pai Kotebagilu, Lohith Mysuru Shivanna, Satish Anandan, Akshatha Nagaraja Thantry, Syeda Farha Siraj

Review Timeline:

Submit Date:	19 Jul 2020
Revised Date:	18 Sep 2020
Accepted Date:	11 Oct 2020

Revision (0)

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

REFEREE: Reviewer | **Revision** (0) 26 Aug 2020

Dear AE,
There are some comments for the authors:
1. Line 46: Authors should clarify when they have performed pre-fasting (how many days before fasting) and post-fasting (at what day of Ramadan).
2. Line 48: For a baseline, 3 hours fasting is not enough time for measurement of serum biochemicals. In addition, authors should specify the time of blood sampling during the fasting day of Ramadan (for post-fasting samples).
3. Line 48: You should describe all methods for every variable you have measured, including muscle mass, intra-, and extra cellular water, body fat, etc., before you describe methods of analysis.
4. Line 56: Please provide CV values for all laboratory measurements.
5. Line 58: Please add a subtitle of “definitions” before “statistics”, and define various definitions used in the manuscript.
6. Line 58: Statistical analysis should be extended to include names of various statistical methods used for every description or comparison between variables.

7. Line 63, Fig. 1: This figure is misleading. This study has no randomization. You have selected 52 out of 69 volunteers and you have performed pre- and post- fasting analysis in all subjects. This figure should be deleted.
8. Tables: Please use only one decimal for all mean and SD values and 2 decimals for numbers below one.
9. Page 6: You should only describe findings. You are not allowed to analyse and/or opinionize findings. Please omit phrases such as: … was found to be beneficial in attaining … (lines 72-73), … due to reduced physical activity … (which you have not assessed) lines 76-77.
10. Line 79: Measurement of body mass should be moved to “methods”. In addition you have not mentioned the method and timing of dietary assessment.
11. Page 10, para 2: You should discuss various aspects of intermittent fasting and its beneficial effects on general health (New England J Med 2019; 381: 2541-51).
12. Line 174: Please add “limitations of study” before conclusion.
13. Table 4: Please calculate and include values for LDL-cholesterol.
Thanks.

REFEREE: Associate Editor | **Revision** (0) 1 Sep 2020

Dear EIC,
Based on the reviewers' comments the manuscript needs major revision.
Thanks.

REFEREE: EIC | **Revision** (0) 2 Sep 2020

Dear Author,
Your article is reviewed by the reviewers carefully. According to their comments, this document needs major revision. Please follow their comments as requested.
Thanks.

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (1)

Reply to Reviewers

Ideally, the reviewing process can significantly improve the submitted manuscripts by allowing the authors to take into account the advice of reviewers. Author(s) must reply to all reviewers' comments in a separate Word file, point by point. A "**Reply to Reviewers**" document is submitted along with revised manuscript during submission of revised files, summarizing the changes that the authors made in response to the reviewers' comments. The responses to reviewers' comments specifies how the authors addressed each comment the reviewers made.

You can read the authors' responses to the reviewers' comments in the next page.

REVISIONS

Manuscript title: **EFFECT OF RAMADAN FASTING ON BODY COMPOSITION, BIOCHEMICAL PROFILE AND ANTIOXIDANT STATUS IN HEALTHY INDIVIDUALS**

Line number	Revisions mentioned by reviewers	Changes incorporated in the manuscript
Line 46	Authors should clarify when they have performed pre-fasting (how many days before fasting) and post-fasting (at what day of Ramadan).	The anthropometric, body composition and biochemical analysis were measured and analyzed two days prior to the beginning of the month of Ramadan (pre-fasting) and two days after the month of Ramadan (post-fasting). The anthropometric measurements included height, weight, BMI and WHR. Parameters such as body fat, muscle mass, intracellular water and exracellular water were measured using the Inbody 770 body composition analyzer (USA). A time gap of 12 hours of fasted state was maintained for blood sampling for biochemical parameters and a minimum of 3 hours was ensured for body composition analysis. The body composition analyzer gives the results of every parameter directly. The sentence has been changed.
Line 48	For baseline, 3 hours fasting is not enough time for measurement of serum biochemicals. In addition, authors should specify the time of blood sampling during fasting day of Ramadan (for post-fasting samples).	
Line 48	You should describe all methods for every variable you have measured, including muscle mass, intra and extra cellular water, body fat etc., before you describe methods of analysis.	
Line 56	Please provide CV values for all laboratory measurements.	Changes have been incorporated in the manuscript
Line 58	Please add a subtitle of “definitions” before “statistics”, and define various definitions used in the manuscript.	Not applicable for our study
Line 58	Statistical analysis should be extended to include names of various statistical methods used for every description or comparison between variables.	Statistical analysis was performed using the statistic software package (SPSS, 16.0, International Business Machines, USA). Descriptive statistics were reported as Mean±SD. The paired sample *t*-test was used to compare the pre and post mean values of anthropometric, body composition, biochemical, and lipid profiles.
Line 63,	Fig. 1: This figure is	The figure has been deleted.

	misleading. This study has no randomization. You have selected 52 out of 69 volunteers and you have performed pre- and post- fasting analysis in all subjects. This _figure should be deleted.	
Tables	Please use only one decimal for all mean and SD values and 2 decimals for numbers below one.	Changes have been incorporated in the manuscript
Page 6:	You should only describe findings. You are not allowed to analyse and/or opinionize findings. Please omit phrases such as: … was found to be beneficial in attaining … (lines 72-73), … due to reduced physical activity … (which you have not assessed) lines 76-77.	The changes have been incorporated in the text.
Line 79:	Measurement of body mass should be moved to “methods”. In addition you have not mentioned method and timing of dietary assessment	The sentence has been deleted.
Page 10, para 2	You should discuss various aspects of intermittent fasting and its beneficial effects in general health (New England J Med 2019; 381: 2541-51).	The relevant aspects has been added in the introduction
Line 174:	Please add “limitations of study” before conclusion	Changes have been incorporated
Table 4	Please calculate and include values for LDL-cholesterol	The values have been calculated and added in the table and as well discussed in the text.

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (1)

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

REFEREE: Associate Editor | **Revision** (1) 11 Oct 2020

Dear EIC,
The authors have responded satisfactorily all the concerns found in the previous version of the manuscript.
Thanks.

REFEREE: EIC | **Revision** (1) 11 Oct 2020

Dear Author,
The document is reviewed carefully by the reviewers. According to their comments and your revisions as requested, this manuscript is accepted.
Thanks.