**OPEN PEER REVIEW**

## Open Peer Review (OPR)

As a new feature for progressing towards transparency, we decided to open a new window for all of our editors as well as authors titled "**Open Peer Review**". We hope by this new facility, our reviewers will be more motivated and authors will be more satisfied with the review process. We believe that publishing our peer review reports could make a transparent and clear environment for all our efforts within a journal, but not all reviewers tend to publish their comments.

## What is "Open Peer Review" process?

An "Open Peer Review" process is making the details of all review process (including reviewers, associate editors, and EICs comments) as "Public" as it is agreed by EIC, Authors, and reviewers.

## Advantages of "Open Peer Review" process

- More transparency, constructiveness and tactful comments of the peer review process: leads to an increase in the quality of reviews
- More motivations for all involved roles in the review process
- Authors' satisfactions from the review process: Increases honesty between authors and reviewers
- Education of both authors and new students
- Prevents reviewers from following their individual agendas and leading to the detection of reviewers' conflicts of interests

You can find out more at:
https://sites.kowsarpub.com/kowsar/knowledgebase/category/tree.html#opr.html

Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences
Article DOI: 10.5812/ijpbs.110483
Published in: Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences: 15(1); e110483

# Peer Review Report for "Exploring Interpersonal Relationship of Female Patients with Persistent Depressive Disorder: A Qualitative Study with a Phenomenological Approach"

**Author(s):** Fatemeh Asadollahi, Hamid Taher Neshat Doost, Mohammad Reza Abedi, Hamid Afshar Zanjani

## Review Timeline:

Submit Date: 20 Oct 2020
Revised Date: 16 Dec 2020
Accepted Date: 31 Dec 2020

Revision (0)

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

**Hamideh Azimi Lolaty**: Reviewer | **Revision** (0) — 10 Nov 2020

Dear AE,
Comments for the authors:
- The title is journalistic. Please replace with:
- 'Exploring Interpersonal relationship of Female Patients with Persistent Depressive Disorder: A Phenomenological Study
'Interpersonal suffering reveal the author (s ) had a judgment, it also reveals the author (s ) did not do bracketing of own mind
- What was the main theme?
- In discission section: The role of culture ???
- Reference 11 years??
- 14 reference under 2010, 8 under 2015 , 22 out of 32
- The text needs new and up-to-date references.
Thanks.

**REFEREE**: Reviewer | **Revision** (0) — 12 Nov 2020

Dear AE,
I have reviewed the article entitled " I Am Wounded; Heal My Wounds with Compassion, Understanding and Respect": A Phenomenological Study of the Interpersonal Suffering of Female Patients with Persistent Depressive Disorder ".
The issue is important and necessary to know more about lived experience of patients with PDD with considering Iranian culture.
There are some matters that should be taken into account:
1- The authors should mention in title and method (abstract and text)section that the study was a qualitative study with phenomenological approach.
2- In line 14:(( a descriptive phenomenological approach was adopted for this study)). This study was not descriptive so delete it.
3- according to guideline of IJPBS,Keywords should be taken from those recommended by the US National Library of Medicine`s Medical Subject Headings(MESH) browser list. You can use the following address: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/mesh/" and they should be ordered according to alphabet.
4- Which author/s conducted the interview? Analysis?
5- In Result section, there are 6 subheading related to themes. Sub-theme of each main theme should be numbered and related meaning unit should be presented.
6- How many data coders coded the data?
7- Please provide a table for presenting demographic characteristics of patients and considering privacy issues, give each patients a number, fore example P1 and delet the names.
8- In line 258, it was written about "jealousy" ,but it was not related to any theme and sub-theme.
9- In discussion, there are repetition of results, please remove all numbered themes and just mention to previous studies and its relation to current study. Discussion should be shorthened.
10- In line: 417: the sentences should be edited again, It is unclear." women's self-esteem and self-esteem and reduced their self-confidence and self-esteem"
11- In line 435: the sentences seems to a personal idea with no scientific document, If the authors have any reference please mention it." perfectionism seems prominent in Isfahan's culture"
Thanks.

**Siavash Moradi**: Reviewer | **Revision** (0) 17 Nov 2020

Dear AE,
This manuscript needs only minor revision.
Thanks.

**REFEREE**: Associate Editor | **Revision** (0) 26 Nov 2020

Dear EIC,
The authors should revise the article according to reviewers` comments.
Thanks

**Mehran Zarghami**: EIC | **Revision (0)** 1 Dec 2020

Dear Author,

Your paper has been evaluated by external peer reviewers. Please do your revisions according to the reviewers' comments. I appreciate you doing the revisions as soon as possible by using the track changes mode in MS Word and using colored text.

After revision authors are obliged to upload reviewers' comments word file in which they have replied to all comments one by one.

Besides, please pay attention to the word count limitation:

Word count limits are declared in this link: http://kowsarpub.com/en/index.php/services/for-authors/895-word-count

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript. Thank you for sending your work to the Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences.

Thanks.

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (1)

## Reply to Reviewers

Ideally, the reviewing process can significantly improve the submitted manuscripts by allowing the authors to take into account the advice of reviewers. Author(s) must reply to all reviewers' comments in a separate Word file, point by point. A "**Reply to Reviewers**" document is submitted along with revised manuscript during submission of revised files, summarizing the changes that the authors made in response to the reviewers' comments. The responses to reviewers' comments specifies how the authors addressed each comment the reviewers made.

You can read the authors' responses to the reviewers' comments in the next page.

Dear Editor and reviewer,

Thanks for the time taken to review this manuscript and the suggestions to improve it. The authors have completed some minor and also major changes in the revised version of the manuscript. We would like to respond to the comments as below.

Before responding to the reviewers, we should note that due to the close relationship between the themes of not meeting psychological needs and the feeling of being ignored, the authors of the article placed the theme of not meeting psychological needs as a sub-theme of the feeling of being ignored. Therefore, five main themes were mentioned in this article.

**Reviewer 1:**

**Comment:** the title is journalistic..Please replace with: 'Exploring Interpersonal relationship of Female Patients with Persistent Depressive Disorder: A Phenomenological Study'
'Interpersonal sufering' reveale the athour (s ) had a jugdment , it also reveale the athour (s ) did not do braketing of own mind

***Response:*** The required revision was made.

---

**Comment:** what was the main theme?

***Response:*** The major theme was the one mentioned in the title, and for this reason, it was placed in the title. “I Am Wounded; Heal My Wounds with Compassion, Understanding and Respect”

---

**Comment:** *in discussion section: The role of culture?*

***Response:*** I did not understand exactly what the respected reviewer means. However, the title of this section changed to "the role of culture in the lived experience of women with Persistent depressive disorder"

---

**Comment:** reference 11 year? 14 references under 2010, 8 under 2015, 22 out of 32. The text needs new and up to date references.

***Response:*** Some old sources were removed, and new sources were replaced. However, despite searching various databases, no new sources were found for some of the articles published before 2010. In addition, some sources such as Joyner (1997) and Mapp (2008) are among the main sources of the article and they should be cited.

---

**Reviewer 2:**

**Comment:** 1- The authors should mention in title and method (abstract and text) section that the study was a qualitative study with phenomenological approach.

***Response:*** The required revision was made.

---

**Comment:** 2- In line 14 :(( a descriptive phenomenological approach was adopted for this study)). This study was not descriptive so delete it

***Response:*** According to Mapp (2008), Giorgi (1997), and Joyner (1997), this issue and the method used for analysis, namely the Giorgi method, are a subset of descriptive phenomenology. However, if the reviewer prefers the word descriptive be omitted, we will omit that word.

- Giorgi, A. (1997). The theory, practice, and evaluation of the phenomenological method as a qualitative research procedure. *Journal of phenomenological psychology*, *28*(2), 235-260.
- Mapp T. Understanding phenomenology: the lived experience. British Journal of Midwifery. 2008;16(5):308-11. doi: org/10.12968/bjom.2008.16.5.29192.
- Joyner, JD. A phenomenological exploration of suffering within chronic depressive illness [dissertation]: Catholic University of America; 1997.

**Comment:** 3- according to guideline of IJPBS, Keywords should be taken from those recommended by the US National Library of Medicine`s Medical Subject Headings(MESH) browser list. You can use the following address: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/mesh/" and they should be ordered according to alphabet.

***Response:*** We searched keywords such as "phenomenology" and "lived experience" in the above-mentioned site, but nothing found. While this research is conducted on patients with persistent depressive disorder, when the "persistent depressive disorder" was searched, just one of its subdivisions that is "dysthymia" displayed.
In addition, the keywords was ordered according to alphabet.

**Comment:** 4- Which author/s conducted the interview? Analysis?

***Response:*** The first author conducted the interviews, and the data were analyzed by the first, second and third authors.

**Comment:** 5- In Result section, there are 6 subheading related to themes. Sub-theme of each main theme should be numbered and related meaning unit should be presented.

***Response:*** The required revision was made.

**Comment:** 6- How many data coders coded the data?

***Response:*** Apart from the first and third authors, a psychologist and a psychiatrist, who are not among the authors of the article, simultaneously coded the data.

**Comment:** 7- Please provide a table for presenting demographic characteristics of patients and considering privacy issues give each patients a number, for example P1 and delete the names.

***Response:*** The demographic table is presented in the method section.

**Comment:** 8- In line 258, it was written about "jealousy" ,but it was not related to any theme and sub-theme.

***Response:*** This section was deleted.

**Comment:** *9- In discussion, there are repetition of results, please remove all numbered themes and just mention to previous studies and its relation to current study. Discussion should be shortened*

***Response:*** The discussion section was corrected and rewritten again but according to the number of the main themes and the importance cultural explanation, cannot be more shortened.

**Comment:** 10- In line: 417: the sentences should be edited again, It is unclear.” women’s self-esteem and self-esteem and reduced their self-confidence and self-esteem”

***Response:*** The required revision was made.

**Comment:** 11- In line 435: the sentences seems to a personal idea with no scientific document, If the authors have any reference please mention it.” perfectionism seems prominent in Isfahan’s culture”

***Response:*** If we want to find the mental logic of Isfahani individuals from the worldview level, there are three basic keywords, namely order, organization, and etiquette. For such a character in Isfahan, the world must be defined in an organized manner. Everything has its place, its own order, beginning and ending, and everything has its own etiquette. The order also includes objects. In other words, order indicates the definition of objects, their position and status in the mentality of the basic Isfahani personality, and etiquette indicates ethics and good behavior towards or by them (Rahmani, 2017). Although few statistical studies are available, based on the findings of Rahmani (2017) and the reports and clinical experiences of experts, it seems that the characteristic of perfectionism has a significant influence on the culture of Isfahan.

Kind regards,
Hamid Taher Neshat Doost

**OPEN PEER REVIEW**

**Revision (1)**

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

**REFEREE**: Associate Editor | **Revision** (1) 26 Dec 2020

Dear EIC,
Thanks for revising the article according to the reviewers` comments.
Thanks.

**Mehran Zarghami**: EIC | **Revision** (1) 31 Dec 2020

Dear Authors,
We have completed our review of your manuscript and are pleased to inform you that it is considered for publication in the IJPBS. Note that the publication of your article will only be finalized upon your cooperation with the editorial processing.
Thank you for your fine contribution. On behalf of the Editors of IJPBS, we look forward to your continued contributions to the Journal.
Thanks.