IJ Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences
Volume 17 · Issue 3 · e132909

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Prevalence of Nomophobia and Associated Factors in Adolescent Female Students: A Cross-sectional Study in Northern Iran

Sanaz Jamshidifar, Forouzan Elyasi, Parastoo Karimi Aliabadi, Seyed Jaber Musavi, Ali Ershad

SUBMITTED	REVISED	ACCEPTED	DOI
27 Nov 2022	7 Jun 2023	5 Jul 2023	10.5812/ijpbs-132909

About this report

This open peer review (OPR) report shows the public comments made on this article during peer review, by the reviewers, the associate editor and the editor-in-chief, for every revision round, together with the authors' replies. Comments appear only with the consent of the people who wrote them. Reviewers who chose to sign their report are named; the others are shown as "Referee". Comments are edited for language only, and confidential remarks to the editors are not included.

More about open peer review: brieflands.com/knowledgebase/opr

Contents

1 **Original submission** Pezhman Hadinezhad, Editor-in-Chief 2

2 **Revision 1** Referee 1, Pezhman Hadinezhad, Editor-in-Chief 3

Authors' reply to reviewers 4

Reviewer and editor comments 10

1 Original submission

2 comments · 9 Dec 2022 – 21 Apr 2023

Pezhman Hadinezhad Reviewer

MINOR REVISION 9 Dec 2022

Subject:
The article is within the scope of the journal, but it lacks novelty.

Title:
The title reflects the content appropriately, but not with respect to mobile dependence.

Abstract
There is a structured abstract, and the keywords are selected from MESH.

Introduction
The objectives are not clearly stated, especially in terms of mobile phone dependence. Please explain mobile phone dependence in more detail.

Result:
Please summarize and reorganize the tables; there is a lot of less important information with so many confusing details.

References
Many of the references used in this manuscript are more than 5 years old.

Editor-in-Chief

MINOR REVISION 21 Apr 2023

Thank you for submitting your manuscript for consideration for publication in Progress in Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences (previously named Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences). Your paper has been evaluated by external peer reviewers. Please make your revisions according to the reviewers' comments.

After revision, authors are obliged to upload a Word file containing the reviewers' comments, in which they have replied to all comments one by one.

Besides, please pay attention to the word count limitation:
Word count limits are provided at this link: http://kowsarpub.com/en/index.php/services/for-authors/895-word-count

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript. Thank you for sending your work to the Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences. The full manuscript file must be highlighted to indicate revised text.

2

Revision 1

AUTHORS' RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS

Authors' reply to reviewers

The next pages contain the authors' point-by-point reply to the comments of this revision round, as submitted with the revised manuscript. It is published as the authors wrote it.

Dear Editor-in-chief

Thanks for valuable comments on the manuscript entitled “The Prevalence of Nomophobia and their Associated Factors in Adolescent Female Students: A Cross-Sectional Study in Northern Iran”. The response to comments is as follows. Also, the changes have been highlighted (yellow color) in main manuscript file.

Best Regards

Forouzan Elyasi

Reviewers' Comments:

Reviewer 1:
Subject:
The article within the scope of the journal But it doesn’t have novelty.
Answer: Thank you for your valuable comment

Title:
The title reflects the content appropriately, But not for mobile dependence.

Answer: Mobile Phone Dependence was removed from the title*.*

Abstract
there is a structured abstract and the keywords selected from MESH.

Answer: Thank you.

Introduction
The objectives are not clearly stated, especially in terms of mobile phone dependence. Please explain about mobile phone dependence with more details.

Answer: Definition of Mobile Phone Dependence added.

In recent times the concept of behavioral addiction has attracted the attention of researchers and has been shown to be equivalent to substance dependence understood by current nosological systems (Dixit,2010, Arumugam B,2014). Behavioral Addiction to mobile phones has been called by different names as Mobile phone Dependence, Cell phone addiction, Problem cell phone use ,mobile phone abuse (Bivin JB,2013 ., King AL,2014 ., Lopez-Fernandez O,2014)

References
A lot of references that used in this manuscript are belong to more than 5 years ago.

Answer: To define the used concepts and tools, it was necessary to refer to references older than 5 years.

Such as Definition of Mobile Phone Dependence:

In recent times the concept of behavioral addiction has attracted the attention of researchers and has been shown to be equivalent to substance dependence understood by current nosological systems (Dixit,2010, Arumugam B,2014). Behavioral Addiction to mobile phones has been called by different names as Mobile phone Dependence, Cell phone addiction, Problem cell phone use ,mobile phone abuse (Bivin JB,2013 ., King AL,2014 ., Lopez-Fernandez O,2014)

Reviewer 2:
Thank you for submitting your paper to Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, but your article needs to be reviewed and completed in some parts, for example;

1. Referred references in the text need to be edited (some references do not match the text)

Answer: Was corrected.

In the last paragraph of the introduction, reference number 8 was mistakenly referred to. Therefore, it was deleted.

Nowadays, mainly during the outbreak of coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19), electronic learning (e-learning) has replaced face-to-face one (8).

2. Lines 74 and 76 mention that girls from grades 10th and 11th were included in the study, but according to the information in other parts of the article as well as table 5, the samples were from grades 9th, 10th, 11th, and 12th.

Answer: **The academic level of the students was corrected in the text of the manuscript.**

The statistical population consisted of all adolescent female students (n=16,313) enrolled in the 9th, 10th, and 11th and 12 th grades of 69 high schools in the school year calendar of 2019-2020.

3. For the demographic information questionnaire, more details should be mentioned about the information obtained in this study (including family income, etc., which is explained in the text of the article)

Answer: Other variables added.

[The sociodemographic characteristics of the participants included gender, age, Marital status, Place of residence, Type of school, academic level, place of living, level of education of parents, Parental Working status, Household income, History of mental disorders, Family history of psychiatric disorders, Smoking/drug abuse.]

4. Lines 94 and 95,, the more and less signs used to explain the NMP questionnaire are incorrectly inserted.

Answer: Thank you for your valuable comment. The correction was done

5. Lines 154 and 155 have writing errors (sections 11, 10, 10 and 12)

Answer: The correction was done.

It should be noted that 86.3% of the participants were living in rural areas, and the rest were in urban ones, out of which 25.4% , 25.6%, 27.4%, and 21.6% were enrolled in the 9th, 10th, 11th, and 12th grades, respectively*.*

6. Line 159 (40,000) does not match the data in the table.

Answer: The correction was done.

the monthly charge of the mobile phones ranged from 0 to 40,00000 Iranian Rial (IRR) with a mean monthly amount of 350.000±46.000 IRR and a median of 200.000 IRR.

7. The line of 163 numbers mentioned as the average MDP needs to be corrected (75.54 ± 21.61)

Answer: Thank you for your valuable comment. The correction was done

8. Line 177, the P value mentioned for the father's education does not match the P value mentioned for the father's education in the table (in the table, the P value mentioned for the father's education and the P value mentioned for the mother's education do not match with the text)

Answer: The names of father and mother were wrongly written in the table, which were corrected.

9. The text given about the results from line 186-182 is given in supplementary table no. 1, but there is no reference in the text.

Answer: Source to supplementary table no.1 given in text

10. From line 188 of the results section (Relationship between NMP and MPD), the number of the referenced tables does not match with the corresponding table.

Answer: Source to supplementary table no.2 given in text

11. The first column of Table 4 needs to be corrected.

Answer: The correction was done

Reviewer 3:
Dear author
I found the subject interesting but, I think the manuscript needs some revision as below:
1- Time of the study should be mentioned in the title of cross-sectional studies.

Answer: The correction was done

2- Some results have been replicated in conclusion. The conclusion and application of the results should be mentioned in this part.

Answer: The first two lines were moved from the conclusion section to the discussion section.

3- Key words must be selected from MESH and ordered alphabetically.

Answer: The correction was done

4- "objective" must be added as a separated part in the abstract and body of the manuscript.

Answer: "objective" added**.**

5- You said “In 2019, it was reported that mobile phone users worldwide exceeded five billion people, and…”, but according the reference 4 “The number of mobile phone users in 2019 is reported to be 4.68 billion people”.

Answer: Thank you for your valuable comment. The correction was done

6- Validity and reliability of “CPAS” in the study population must be described and it references must be added.

Answer: Validity and reliability of “CPAS” added.

The face validity and content validity of CPAS have been reported in a qualitative way. Reliability using the internal consistency method by calculating the Cronbach's alpha coefficient was performed on 637 high school students of Birjand schools and reported as 0.81.(Khazaie 2013)

7- The educational level of the participants is reported differently in different parts of the manuscript.

Answer: The corrections were done

The statistical population consisted of all adolescent female students (n=16,313) enrolled in the 9th, 10th, and 11th and 12 th grades of 69 high schools in the school year calendar of 2019-2020.

8- The ethical code of the study seems to be mentioned incorrectly.

Answer: The correction was done

IR.MAZUMS.IMAMHOSPITAL.REC.1398.038

9- Please clarify how did you evaluate the psychiatric history of the participants and their families?

Answer: The history of individual mental disorder and the family history of mental disorder were obtained by self-reporting.

10- Please revise the references part in accordance with the journal instruction.

Answer: Revisions is done.

11- My decision: minor revision
Sincerely yours

> Associate Editor's Comments:

Associate Editor 1:
Dear author
Many thanks for submitting" The Prevalence of Nomophobia and Mobile Phone Dependence and their Associated Factors in Adolescent Female Students: A Cross-Sectional Study in Northern Iran ". I received comments from reviewers have expertized on the manuscript. The reviewers identified some concerns and believed that the manuscript needs some revisions. Therefore, I conclude the manuscript has the potential of consideration for publication after satisfactorily addressing reviewers concerns. Therefore, I invite you to reply to the reviewers’ comments and resubmit your revised

manuscript for further review. If you choose to revise your submission please upload your revised manuscript and an annotated list addressing the reviewers' comments and highlighting where changes have been made to the manuscript.
My decision: minor revision
sincerely yours

> EIC Decision:

Thank you for submitting your manuscript for consideration for publication in Progress in Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences (previously named Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences). Your paper has been evaluated by external peer reviewers. Please do your revisions according to the reviewers' comments. I appreciate you to do the revisions as soon as possible.

After revision authors are obliged to upload reviewers' comments word file in which they have replied to all comments one by one.

Besides, please pay attention to the word count limitation:
Word count limits are declared in this link: http://kowsarpub.com/en/index.php/services/for-authors/895-word-count

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript. Thank you for sending your work to the Iranian Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences. The full manuscript file must be highlighted to indicate revised texts.

2 Revision 1

3 comments · 10 Jun 2023 – 5 Jul 2023

Referee 1 Reviewer

ACCEPT 10 Jun 2023

Thank you for the revisions of your valuable manuscript.

Pezhman Hadinezhad Reviewer

ACCEPT 4 Jul 2023

Thanks for the revision.
All of the comments that were mentioned before were considered by the authors.
So this manuscript can be accepted for publication from my point of view.
Sincerely,

Editor-in-Chief

ACCEPT 5 Jul 2023

We have completed our review of your manuscript and are pleased to inform you that it is being considered for publication in the IJPBS. Note that the publication of your article will only be finalized with your cooperation in the editorial process.
Thank you for your fine contribution. On behalf of the Editors of IJPBS, we look forward to your continued contributions to the Journal.