Journal of Clinical Research in Paramedical Sciences
Volume 12 · Issue 1 · e137291

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Comparing the Effectiveness of Mode Deactivation Therapy and Cognitive Behavioral Therapy on Anxiety and Self-concept Clarity in Students with Generalized Anxiety Disorder

Hajar Adelifard, Moloud Keykhosrovani, Seyed Asghar Mousavi

SUBMITTED	REVISED	ACCEPTED	DOI
30 Apr 2023	31 May 2023	11 Jun 2023	10.5812/jcrps-137291

About this report

This open peer review (OPR) report shows the public comments made on this article during peer review, by the reviewers, the associate editor and the editor-in-chief, for every revision round, together with the authors' replies. Comments appear only with the consent of the people who wrote them. Reviewers who chose to sign their report are named; the others are shown as "Referee". Comments are edited for language only, and confidential remarks to the editors are not included.

More about open peer review: brieflands.com/knowledgebase/opr

Contents

1 **Original submission** Associate Editor, Editor-in-Chief 2
2 **Revision 1** Associate Editor, Editor-in-Chief 3
Authors' reply to reviewers 4
Reviewer and editor comments 8

1 Original submission

2 comments · 20 May 2023 – 20 May 2023

Associate Editor

MAJOR REVISION 20 May 2023

Major Revision

Editor-in-Chief

MAJOR REVISION 20 May 2023

Major Revision

2

Revision 1

AUTHORS' RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS

Authors' reply to reviewers

The next pages contain the authors' point-by-point reply to the comments of this revision round, as submitted with the revised manuscript. It is published as the authors wrote it.

Dear Editor,

Thank you very much for your valuable comments. Please find the explanation as following:

Reviewer 1:

Dear Editor,

The topic of the research is interesting. I have however some concerns and here are my specific comments:

1- In the background section of the abstract, there is no mention of the introduction and necessity of the research.

Done.

2- Mention the time of the research in the abstract section.

Done.

3- “The participants completed the State-Trait Anxiety Inventory and the Self-Concept Clarity Scale.” When were these questionnaires completed?

Done. (The participants completed the State-Trait Anxiety Inventory and the Self-Concept Clarity Scale in two stages, pretest and posttest.)

4- Set keywords based on the mesh.

Done.

5- Begin the results section of the abstract with a description of the participants.

Done.

6- To strengthen the introduction, refer to the results of previous studies.

Done.

7- At the end of the introduction section, mention the necessity of studying. In this section, mention the objectives or questions of the research.

Done.

8- In the methods section, remove “Bushehr Province.”

Done.

9- Regarding the choice of sample size, please provide explanations in the method section.

Done.

10- Complete the research inclusion and exclusion criteria.

Done.

11- In the Procedure section, mention what you did with the control group.

Done.

12- Draw the CONSORT flow diagram of the research.

Done.

13- Report the within-group P-values in Table 3.

Done.

14- In addition to P-values, report F-values in the results section.

Done.

15- Present the limitations of the research in the discussion section.

Done.

16- It is better to present your practical suggestions in the conclusion section.

Done.

Reviewer 2:

Dear EIC,

The manuscript was reviewed, and there are some comments which should be addressed by the author. According to the comments, the manuscript needs major revision.

Abstract:

In this study, the author compared two interventions. Therefore, the title of the article should mention the comparison of the two interventions.

Done.

In the abstract, as an introduction, before mentioning the objectives of the study, clarify the research context.

Done.

In the abstract section, mention the names of the interventions instead of the first and second experimental groups.

Done.

In the abstract section, specify what interventions were performed for the experimental groups.

Done.

Descriptive results including the mean and standard deviation of anxiety and self-concept clarity in students with generalized anxiety disorder should be mentioned in the abstract results.

Done.

Introduction:

The description of generalized anxiety disorder in the introduction section is not enough. The author should provide more information about its concept in the introduction section.

Done.

Explain self-concept clarity in the introduction section. What is the importance of this variable?

Done.

What were your goals for the research?

Done.

Methods:

How did you determine the sample size?

Done.

What was the time frame of the research?

Done.

In the method section, the criteria for entering the research are mentioned, but there is no trace of the exclusion criteria! What were the criteria for exiting the research?

Done.

Mention the reliability of the tool used in this research in the tool section.

Done.

Who conducted the mode deactivation therapy (MDT) and cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT) intervention sessions?

Done.

Results:

Compare the research sample in terms of demographic variables.

Done.

Present the findings related to the normality of the data in the results section.

Done.

In the results section, the means of the three groups are not compared. The author should report these comparisons in the form of a table in the results section.

Done.

Discussion:

To explain the results, the material presented in the discussion section is not enough. Explain your results by presenting persuasive arguments.

Done.

Did this study have any limitations? Please explain.

Done.

Regards

2 Revision 1

2 comments · 11 Jun 2023 – 11 Jun 2023

Associate Editor

ACCEPT 11 Jun 2023

Accept

Editor-in-Chief

ACCEPT 11 Jun 2023

Accept