Jundishapur Journal of Chronic Disease Care
Volume 12 · Issue 2 · e132001

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Assessment of Laboratory and Clinical Data in COVID-19 Patients Treated by Convalescent Plasma

Haniye Salimi, Alireza Salah, Mozhde Heidari, Mohsen Moghadami, Mohammad Javad Fallahi, Farid Zand, Mohammadhossein Karimi

SUBMITTED	REVISED	ACCEPTED	DOI
24 Oct 2022	8 May 2023	31 May 2023	10.5812/jjcdc-132001

About this report

This open peer review (OPR) report shows the public comments made on this article during peer review, by the reviewers, the associate editor and the editor-in-chief, for every revision round, together with the authors' replies. Comments appear only with the consent of the people who wrote them. Reviewers who chose to sign their report are named; the others are shown as "Referee". Comments are edited for language only, and confidential remarks to the editors are not included.

More about open peer review: brieflands.com/knowledgebase/opr

Contents

1 **Original submission** Referee 1, Associate Editor, Editor-in-Chief 2

2 **Revision 1** Referee 1, Associate Editor, Editor-in-Chief 3

Authors' reply to reviewers 4

Reviewer and editor comments 7

1 Original submission

3 comments · 5 Jan 2023 – 30 Jan 2023

Referee 1 Reviewer

MAJOR REVISION 5 Jan 2023

Dear Authors;
This manuscript is titled: Assessment of laboratory and clinical data in COVID-19 patients treated by convalescent plasma. I have some comments:
• Please check your keywords against the MeSH database. It seems that the keywords need some revisions.
• The introduction of the abstract should be shortened. The results are poor. There should be more explanation of your findings.
• Please explain more about the novelty of your article in the introduction and discussion.
• The study design has not been explained clearly.
• What was your sample size formula?
• What was your sampling strategy? It is a critical point for external validity in your study. What are your exclusion criteria?
• What strategy did you use for verification bias?
• There are some spelling and grammatical errors in the text. Please correct them.
• Please mention the limitations and strengths of your study. Is there any novelty in your study? Please describe it in the discussion.
thank you

Associate Editor

MAJOR REVISION 22 Jan 2023

Dear Author,
Based on our reviewers' comments, you should revise your manuscript and resubmit.
Thank you

Editor-in-Chief

MAJOR REVISION 30 Jan 2023

Dear Author,
Based on our reviewers' comments, your manuscript needs some revision. Please revise and resubmit.
Thank you

2

Revision 1

AUTHORS' RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS

Authors' reply to reviewers

The next pages contain the authors' point-by-point reply to the comments of this revision round, as submitted with the revised manuscript. It is published as the authors wrote it.

Thanks for your valuable comments, we revised and applied your comments in the article and highlighted as a yellow:

Reviewer 1:

Question 1-Please check your keywords with Mesh data base. Its seems that the keywords need more revised.

Answer: We checked the Mesh data base and were written the all keywords according to Mesh data base.

Question: 2- In introduction of abstract should be shortened. Result is poor, it should be more explanation about your finding.

Answer: In the abstract section, the introduction has revised and shortened, also the essential findings are written in result section

Question 3- Please explain more about the novelty of your article in introduction and discussion

Answer: Given that people have recovered from COVID-19 have neutralizing antibody in the serum, and neutralizing antibody have therapeutic effect, the purpose and novelty of this study is to evaluate the effect of convalescent plasma on inflammatory factors as a biomarker to check health status of patients

Question 4-Design of study have not explained clearly

Answer: In this study we have inclusion and exclusion criteria (stated in the text) based on these criteria we have selected patients who recovered from COVID-19 and donate plasma, also for plasma infusion to patients who have hospitalized in ICU we have inclusion and exclusion criteria (stated in the text) that have selected patients based on these criteria.

As a brief, at first we have selected patients who recovered from COVID-19 and we did RT-PCR test to check the disease status of people every two days. We also checked the plasma donor for the presence of Viral disease like HBV, HCV and HIV, as stated in the text. After donor selection, plasma was taken and infused to the COVID-19 patients that hospitalized in ICU. The selection of patients was based on inclusion and exclusion criteria stated in the text.

Question 5-What was your sampling size formula?

Answer: All COVID-19 patients in this study were hospitalized in ICU and unfortunately most of them died during treatment, therefore, we had a small number of patients for research in our project, on the other hand, there were not available enough people who had recovered from COVID-19 and had criteria for plasma donation.

Due to the above two limitations, we could not determine the sample size for our project and we have worked on patients who recovered after plasma infusion

Question: 6-What was your sampling strategy, it is a critical point for external validity in your study. What are exclusion criteria?

Answer: Our strategy for sampling in this study is based on inclusion and exclusion criteria that are stated in the text, Therefore, all plasma donors and COVID-19 patients hospitalized in ICU have been selected for plasma infusion based on criteria that stated in the text.

Question: 7-What strategy did you use for verification bias?

Answer: this study is double-blind study and has been confirmed to be unbiased based on the use of selected inclusion and exclusion criterias.

Question: 8-There are some spelling and grammatical errors in the text please correct them

Answer: The text revised by native speaker regarding to spelling and grammar

Question: 9-Please mention the limitation and strategy point of your study? Are there any novelty in your study? Please describe it in discussion

Answer: limitation:

1- We couldn't follow patient one week after infusion of convalescent plasma, because most of them died during treatment.
2- It was very difficult to find patients based on inclusion and exclusion criteria
3- There were not available enough people that recovered from COVID-19 and they have conditions of donating plasma according to our inclusion and exclusion criteria
4- It was difficult to find patients with similar treatments regimen

Novelty:
One of the ways to treat COVID-19 is to use neutralizing antibody. In this study, we have used convalescent plasma as source of neutralizing antibody, and investigated the effect of this type of plasma and neutralizing antibody on the inflammatory factors patients, to checked the health status patients and the relationship between neutralizing antibody and inflammatory factor.

Reviewer 2:

Question: 1- In the abstract section: reduce the number of words

Answer: The abstract has been revised and shortened

Question: 2-In the discussion section: the effect of age and gender should also be written.

Answer: The effect of age and gender of patients that recovered from Covid-19 have been written in the text and highlighted as a yellow

Question: 3-The explanation about the result should be written in the discussion section

Answer: The results have been discussed in the discussion and highlighted as yellow

Question: 4-In the source section: use newer references, most of references are old

Answer: Up to date references have been added to article and highlighted

2 Revision 1

3 comments · 31 May 2023 – 31 May 2023

Referee 1 Reviewer

ACCEPT 31 May 2023

Dear Author,
All comments have been addressed, and this manuscript in its current version is acceptable. Thank you.

Associate Editor

ACCEPT 31 May 2023

Dear Author,
Thank you for your revision. This manuscript is acceptable.
Thank you

Editor-in-Chief

ACCEPT 31 May 2023

Dear Author,
The manuscript in the current format is acceptable for publication.
Thank you