OPEN PEER REVIEW

Open Peer Review (OPR)

As a new feature for progressing towards transparency, we decided to open a new window for all of our editors as well as authors titled "**Open Peer Review**". We hope by this new facility, our reviewers will be more motivated and authors will be more satisfied with the review process. We believe that publishing our peer review reports could make a transparent and clear environment for all our efforts within a journal, but not all reviewers tend to publish their comments.

What is "Open Peer Review" process?

An "Open Peer Review" process is making the details of all review process (including reviewers, associate editors, and EICs comments) as "Public" as it is agreed by EIC, Authors, and reviewers.

Advantages of "Open Peer Review" process

- More transparency, constructiveness and tactful comments of the peer review process: leads to an increase in the quality of reviews
- More motivations for all involved roles in the review process
- Authors' satisfactions from the review process: Increases honesty between authors and reviewers
- Education of both authors and new students
- Prevents reviewers from following their individual agendas and leading to the detection of reviewers' conflicts of interests

You can find out more at:
https://sites.kowsarpub.com/kowsar/knowledgebase/category/tree.html#opr.html

Jundishapur Journal of Natural Pharmaceutical Products
Article DOI: 10.5812/jjnpp.114152
Published in: Jundishapur Journal of Natural Pharmaceutical Products: 16(4); e114152

Peer Review Report for "Evaluating the Efficacy of Lotion Containing Black Rice Bran (*Oryza sativa* L. *indica*) Extract as Skin Brightening Agent: A Clinical Trial"

Author(s): Mahdi Jufri, Afifah Vardhani, Erni Purwaningsih

Review Timeline:

Submit Date: 3 May 2021
Revised Date: 20 Jun 2021
Accepted Date: 22 Jun 2021

Revision (0)

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

REFEREE: Reviewer | **Revision** (0)

17 May 2021

Dear AE,

The present study aims to evaluate the effect of a lotion containing 10% black rice bran ethanol extract to alleviate hyperpigmentation in 34 women subjects over a 1-month duration. The article is interesting, relevant, and timely since it is focused on the discovery of a natural skin-lightening agent for cosmeceutical purposes. However, some points should be addressed:

1. Line 23-24: Radical oxygen species formation triggered by UV exposure could induce lipid peroxidation, leading to melanogenesis [1].

Please provide a more suitable reference for this statement. The study by [1] focused on antioxidant activity and was not related to melanogenesis.

2. Line 25-26: It is complex, gradual [2], and involves the biosynthesis of tyrosinase [3].

“biosynthesis of tyrosinase” seems inappropriate. Melanogenesis is a complex process involving the activities of tyrosinase and other tyrosinase-related proteins.

3. Line 36: the extract inhibited tyrosinase activity at an IC50 of 74.8 [8].

Please provide the unit for IC50 value.

4. Line 42-43: Please correct the typo “Dopakuinone” and “dopaque”.

5. Line 58: BHT
Please provide the full term where it is first mentioned. Abbreviation can be used after the first mention.
6. Line 102: 2.2.3.4 Lotion application
How many times do the volunteers apply the lotion daily?
7. Line 113: Measurement of the skin brightness and erythema level using Mexameter…
Please provide info on the Mexameter model and manufacturing company.
8. Result and Discussion
It would be better if the author could mention the right volar was applied with extract whereas the left volar was applied with placebo at the beginning of the discussion. Or, use “lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract” and “placebo” instead of left/right volar in result presentation and discussion. “lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract” and “placebo” are more direct for readers to understand.
9. Table 1 & 2: Please correct the typo “melanine”.
10. Table 1, 2, 3, 4: The correct term should be “standard deviation”.
Also, please consider combining Tables 1 & 2 because they represent the results for melanin index. The same goes for Tables 3 & 4.
11. Line 155-156: In this study, a significant decrease in the melanin index and the skin's erythema index was applied to the lotion containing black rice bran extract.
This sentence is confusing. Do the authors mean:
“In this study, a significant decrease in the melanin index and the skin's erythema index was recorded when the skin was applied with a lotion containing black rice bran extract.”
12. Line 156-157: The erythema index of the skin on the arm that was applied “to” the control lotion also decreased significantly.
Kindly amend “to” to “with”.
13. Line 175: Inhibition of pigment production
Inhibition of “microphthalmia-associated transcription factor (MITF)” would be more appropriate.
14. Line 180: Reactive oxygen species (ROS) reduction,
The author mentioned that black rice bran extract is a strong antioxidant. But how does a strong antioxidant reduce melanin production? Please provide a brief explanation.
15. Line 195: In this study, there was a “significant decrease in skin color” on the right arm
Only melanin and erythema index were measured in this study, not skin colour. Please consider changing the sentence to “In this study, there was a significant decrease in both melanin and erythema indices upon the application of a lotion containing black rice bran extract”.
16. Line 196-202: This statement should be included in Section 2.2.3.5
17. Line 196-198: The Mexameter reads the melanin index at 660 nm and 880 nm “wavelengths”. In comparison, the erythema index (hemoglobin) on the device is read at 568 nm and 660 nm “wavelengths”
nm indicates the wavelength, please remove the word “wavelengths” in the sentence.
18. Line 203-213: This part discussed the correlation between melanin and erythema index. Please provide the correlation graph as a Result.
Thanks.

REFEREE: Reviewer | **Revision** (0) 28 May 2021

Dear AE,

Comments for the authors:

- Line 12: The word “t-test” should be in italic
- Line 13: Are you sure the word “application”?, not software?
- Line 15: The comma (,) should be replaced by a full stop (.)
- Line 16: Conclusion: the lotion… the alphabet “t” should be uppercase.
- Line 19 – 20: “Oryza sativa l. indica”… I think alphabet “l” should be uppercase.
- Line 20: Please remove the comma after word “indica”
- Line 25: I think the citation should be at the end of the sentence
- Line 33 – 34: The citation number should be after the author’s name
- Line 35: The full stop after “oryzanol” should be removed.
- Line 37 – 38: Please revise the sentences. Not clear
- Line 40 – 42: Please revise the sentences.
- Line 42: Please put the word “a” before the word “very”. Please check grammar carefully.
- Line 42 – 44: Please revise the sentence. Check your English carefully.
- Line 53: Please remove comma “,” after word “Java”.
- Line 56 – 59: Please put the brand and the country in the bracket. List all the brands and the country of the chemicals listed.
- Line 58: What is BHT? Should be in full name at first mention.
- Line 62: Please rephrase the word “via” with “using”
- Line 64 – 65: Please remove the last sentence. This sentence should be in the discussion.
- Line 67 – 68: Please revise the sentence. I think the word “include” is not suitable to use. Should be replaced with “consist of”. Please check the symbol, comma and full stop in this sentence.
- Line 69 – 70: Please revise the sentence. Please improve your English.
- Line 71: Please check how you write the symbol. Please correct it.
- Line 72: The mixing? I think the word “the mixture” should be proper to use. Please check your English.
- Line 73: Homogenization? Homogenization of what? Please mention it.
- Line 75 – 77: Please revise the sentence. Please check your English carefully.
- Line 81: Please replace the word “of” with the word “from”.
- Line 83 – 84: Please remove the last sentence. I think you should explain in the discussion.
- Line 87: Who discontinues applying? Please mention it.
- Line 91 – 94: Please revise the sentences. Check your English carefully.
- Line 96 – 97: I think the first sentence is not suitable to mention here.
- Line 99: Please check your English carefully.
- Line 100 – 101: Please revise the sentences.
- Line 103: Location? Please check your English.
- Line 108: Please write the symbol correctly.
- Line 113: Mexameter is a technique or instrument? If an instrument, please mention the brand and country.
- Line 125: Application? Do you mean software?
- Line 136 – 137: I think only the t-test should be in italic and the alphabet “T” should be in lowercase.

- Line 144: Please revise the sentence. Please check your English carefully. The word “and” is not proper to use to start the sentence.
- Line 167 – 193: Why are you mentioning all these inhibitions? Do you perform all the analysis?
- Line 208: I think 7th should be written in word.
- Line 210: The number below 10 should be written in word.
- Line 215: Please include recommendations in the conclusion.

Thanks.

Olalere Abayomi Olusegun: Associate Editor | **Revision (0)** 31 May 2021

Dear EIC,

The manuscript is studied, and there are some comments which should be addressed by the author. According to the comments, the document needs major revision.

Kind regards,

REFEREE: EIC | **Revision (0)** 31 May 2021

Dear Authors,

We have received the reviewers' comments on your manuscript, they suggest major changes. we will reconsider your revised manuscript for possible publication as soon as we receive it. Please provide point-to-point answers to reviewers' comments and highlight them in the revised manuscript.

We are looking forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Kind regards

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (1)

Reply to Reviewers

Ideally, the reviewing process can significantly improve the submitted manuscripts by allowing the authors to take into account the advice of reviewers. Author(s) must reply to all reviewers' comments in a separate Word file, point by point. A "**Reply to Reviewers**" document is submitted along with revised manuscript during submission of revised files, summarizing the changes that the authors made in response to the reviewers' comments. The responses to reviewers' comments specifies how the authors addressed each comment the reviewers made.

You can read the authors' responses to the reviewers' comments in the next page.

Reviewers' Comments:

Reviewer 1:

The present study aims to evaluate the effect of a lotion containing 10% black rice bran ethanol extract to alleviate hyperpigmentation in 34 women subjects over a 1-month duration. The article is interesting, relevant and timely since it is focused on the discovery of a natural skin-lightening agent for cosmeceutical purposes. However, some points should be addressed:

1. Line 23-24: Radical oxygen species formation triggered by UV exposure could induce lipid peroxidation, leading to melanogenesis [1].

Please provide a more suitable reference for this statement. The study by [1] focused on antioxidant activity and was not related to melanogenesis.

Serre C, Busuttil V, Botto J-M. Intrinsic and extrinsic regulation of human skin melanogenesis and pigmentation. International Journal of Cosmetic Science. 2018: 40(4), 328-47.

2. Line 25-26: It is complex, gradual [2], and involves the biosynthesis of tyrosinase [3].

“biosynthesis of tyrosinase” seems inappropriate. Melanogenesis is a complex process involving the activities of tyrosinase and other tyrosinase-related proteins.

Ultraviolet irradiation, through several pathways, could modulate melanogenesis. Melanogenesis is the process of melanin formation in the skin. It is a complex process involving the activities of tyrosinase and other tyrosinase-related proteins.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

3. Line 36: the extract inhibited tyrosinase activity at an IC50 of 74.8 [8].

Please provide the unit for IC50 value.

IC50 of 74.8 µg/ml

4. Line 42-43: Please correct the typo “Dopakuinone” and “dopaque”.

Dopaquinone is a compound with a very high reactivity, it can polymerize to form a dopachrome, which then forms melanin.

5. Line 58: BHT

Please provide the full term where it is first mentioned. Abbreviation can be used after the first mention.

Done. Thank you

6. Line 102: 2.2.3.4 Lotion application

How many times do the volunteers apply the lotion daily?

The application of the lotion containing extract and the lotion containing the placebo as much as 0.5g (area 40-50 mm2) was carried out two times daily, on the right arm for the lotion marked 'Right' each, and the left arm for the lotion labeled 'Left'. Researchers and volunteers did not know the content of each lotion (double-blind). The clinical study was conducted in February – March 2020.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

7. Line 113: Measurement of the skin brightness and erythema level using Mexameter…

Please provide info on the Mexameter model and manufacturing company.

Done thank you

8. Result and Discussion

It would be better if the author could mention the right volar was applied with extract whereas the left volar was applied with placebo at the beginning of the discussion. Or, use “lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract” and “placebo” instead of left/right volar in result presentation and discussion. “lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract” and “placebo” are more direct for readers to understand.

The results were tested with a paired t-test by GraphPad Prism 8.3.0 software. The lotion test containing 10% black rice bran extract and placebo results mean melanin index measurement before applying lotion (day 0) and then re-measured at the end of the test (day 14) are shown in Table 1.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

9. Table 1 & 2: Please correct the typo “melanine”.

Done, thank you.

10. Table 1, 2, 3, 4: The correct term should be “standard deviation”.

Also, please consider combining Tables 1 & 2 because they represent the results for melanin index. The same goes for Tables 3 & 4.

Done combining Sir, thank you.

11. Line 155-156: In this study, a significant decrease in the melanin index and the skin's erythema index was applied to the lotion containing black rice bran extract.

This sentence is confusing. Do the authors mean:

“In this study, a significant decrease in the melanin index and the skin's erythema index was recorded when the skin was applied with a lotion containing black rice bran extract.”

In this study, a significant decrease in the melanin index and the skin's erythema index was recorded when the skin was applied with a lotion containing black rice bran extract.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

12. Line 156-157: The erythema index of the skin on the arm that was applied “to” the control lotion also decreased significantly.

Kindly amend “to” to “with”.

Done, thank you.

13. Line 175: Inhibition of pigment production

Inhibition of “microphthalmia-associated transcription factor (MITF)” would be more appropriate.

I removed the subtitles, Sir.

14. Line 180: Reactive oxygen species (ROS) reduction,

The author mentioned that black rice bran extract is a strong antioxidant. But how does a strong antioxidant reduce melanin production? Please provide a brief explanation.

Antioxidants demonstrate some efficacy in downregulating UV induced hyperpigmentation in the skin.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

15. Line 195: In this study, there was a “significant decrease in skin color” on the right arm

Only melanin and erythema index were measured in this study, not skin colour. Please consider changing the sentence to “In this study, there was a significant decrease in both melanin and erythema indices upon the application of a lotion containing black rice bran extract”.

Done, thank you

16. Line 196-202: This statement should be included in Section 2.2.3.5

Done, thank you

17. Line 196-198: The Mexameter reads the melanin index at 660 nm and 880 nm “wavelengths”. In comparison, the erythema index (hemoglobin) on the device is read at 568 nm and 660 nm “wavelengths”

nm indicates the wavelength, please remove the word “wavelengths” in the sentence.

Done removing word wavelength Sir, thank you.

18. Line 203-213: This part discussed the correlation between melanin and erythema index. Please provide the correlation graph as Result.

Done, thank you.

Reviewer 2:

Line 12: The word “t-test” should be in italic

Done, thank you.

Line 13: Are you sure the word “application”? not software?

The results were tested with a paired t-test by GraphPad Prism 8.3.0 software.

Line 15: The comma (,) should be replaced by full stop (.)

Done, thank you.

Line 16: Conclusion: the lotion… the alphabet “t” should be uppercase.

Done, thank you.

Line 19 – 20: “Oryza sativa l. indica”… I think alphabet “l” should be uppercase.

Done, thank you.

Line 20: Please remove comma after word “indica”

Done, thank you.

Line 25: I think the citation should be at the end of sentence

Done, thank you.

Line 33 – 34: The citation number should be after the author's name

Done, thank you.

Line 35: The full stop after "oryzanol" should be remove.

Done, thank you.

Line 37 – 38: Please revise the sentences. Not clear

Gamma oryzanol in bran is a ferulic acid group, belongs to the phenolic compound. Ferulic acid is the dominant phenolic acid in bran, 56-77% of the total phenol.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 40 – 42: Please revise the sentences.

Tyrosinase is an enzyme that plays a role in the formation of melanin in the epidermis. Its mechanism of action is by catalyzing L-tyrosine's hydroxylation reaction to L-DOPA and the oxidation of L-DOPA to dopaquinone, the two main reactions in melanin biosynthesis. Dopaquinone is a compound with a very high reactivity, it can polymerize to form a dopachrome, which then forms melanin

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 42: Please put a word "a" before word "very". Please check grammar carefully.

Done, thank you.

Line 42 – 44: Please revise the sentence. Check your English carefully.

The present study aimed to evaluate the effects of lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract on skin melanin and erythema index. The effects produced by this lotion were compared with placebo, which is a base lotion without black rice bran (*Oryza sativa* L. *indica*) extract.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 53: Please remove comma "," after word "Java".

Done, thank you.

Line 56 – 59: Please put the brand and the country in bracket. List all the brand and the country of the chemicals listed.

Ethanol 96% (Merck, Germany), demineralized aqua (Brataco, Indonesia), olive oil (Brataco, Indonesia), vaseline album (Brataco, Indonesia), dimethicone (Brataco, Indonesia), cetyl alcohol (Brataco, Indonesia), isopropyl myristate (Brataco, Indonesia), span 80 (Brataco, Indonesia), propylparaben (Brataco, Indonesia), butylated hydroxytoluene (Brataco, Indonesia), tween 80 (Brataco, Indonesia), methylparaben (Brataco, Indonesia), and glycerin (Brataco, Indonesia).

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 58: What is BHT? Should be in full name at first mention.

butylated hydroxytoluene, Sir. Done, thank you.

Line 62: Please rephrase the word “via” with “using”

Done, thank you.

Line 64 – 65: Please remove the last sentence. This sentence should be in discussion.

Done removing, Sir. Thank you.

Line 67 – 68: Please revise the sentence. I think the word “include” is not suitable to use.

Should be replace with “consist of”. Please check the symbol, comma and full stop in this sentence.

Done, thank you.

Line 69 – 70: Please revise the sentence. Please improve your English.

The oil-phase materials consist of olive oil, vaseline album, dimethicone, cetyl alcohol, isopropyl myristate, span 80, and melted at 70°C. Furthermore, BHT was melted into the oil phase. Materials that were in the water phase consist of propylparaben, tween 80, methylparaben, and glycerin. They were dissolved in demineralized aqua at a temperature of 70°C.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 71: Please check how you write the symbol. Please correct it.

Done, thank you.

Line 72: The mixing? I think the word “the mixture” should be proper to use. Please check your English.

Done, thank you.

Line 73: Homogenization? Homogenization of what? Please mention it.

The mixture between the oil and water phase was carried out at a temperature of 70°C, using a homogenizer for 15 minutes at a speed of 3000 rpm. 10% black rice bran extract was added gradually after the emulsion begins to form. Homogenization process was carried out again for the next 15 minutes at a 3000 rpm speed until a homogeneous lotion was developed, then cooled until it reached room temperature. The homogenization process requires a minimum speed of 3000 rpm with a minimum time of 10 minutes.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 75 – 77: Please revise the sentence. Please check your English carefully.

The mixture between the oil and water phase was carried out at a temperature of 70°C, using a homogenizer for 15 minutes at a speed of 3000 rpm. 10% black rice bran extract was added gradually after the emulsion begins to form. Homogenization process was carried out again for the next 15 minutes at a 3000 rpm speed until a homogeneous lotion was developed, then cooled until it reached room temperature. The homogenization process requires a minimum speed of 3000 rpm with a minimum time of 10 minutes.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 81: Please replace word “of” with word “from”.

Done, thank you.

Line 83 – 84: Please remove the last sentence. I think you should explain in discussion.

Done removing, Sir.

Line 87: Who discontinue applying? Please mention it.

Volunteers are suggested to discontinue applying other cosmetic products to the forearm's skin within a week before and during the study and be willing to follow proven research by signing informed consent.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 91 – 94: Please revise the sentences. Check your English carefully.

The exclusion criteria were women with skin disorders such as psoriasis, acne, allergies, wounds, scars, and other skin diseases; pregnant, menopausal, lactating and smoking women; women that are suffering from illness, taking oral or topical medications that affect skin conditions, and unwilling to follow research.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 96 – 97: I think the first sentence not suitable to mention here.

Done removing, Sir.

Line 99: Please check your English carefully.

In this study, the lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract and placebo were tested using a Finn chamber patches attached to the skin on the back. The patches were then removed after 24 hours. Skin reactions were observed and evaluated after 1 hour, 24 hours, and 72 hours. The patches were removed. The reactions observed were in the form of allergies and irritation objectively and subjectively.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 100 – 101: Please revise the sentences.

In this study, the lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract and placebo were tested using a Finn chamber patches attached to the skin on the back. The patches were then removed after 24 hours. Skin reactions were observed and evaluated after 1 hour, 24 hours, and 72 hours. The patches were removed. The reactions observed were in the form of allergies and irritation objectively and subjectively.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 103: Location? Please check your English.

Lotion is applied on volar (forearm).

Line 108: Please write the symbol correctly.

as much as 0.5 g (area 40-50 mm2).

Line 113: Mexameter is a technique or instrument? If instrument, please mention the brand and country.

Instrument. Done mentioning brand and country, Sir.

Line 125: Application? Do you mean software?

GraphPad Prism 8.3.0 software.

Line 136 – 137: I think only t-test should be in italic and the alphabet “T” should be in lowercase.

Done, thank you.

Line 144: Please revise the sentence. Please check your English carefully. The word “and” is not proper to use to start the sentence.

Mexameter can also show the erythema index. Erythema index measurement was done at first before using the lotion (day 0), then re-measured after day 14 to assess the lotion's benefits. The results are displayed in Table 2.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

Line 167 – 193: Why are you mention about all these inhibitions? Do you perform all the analysis?

I mentioned to explain the process of skin lightening in some mechanisms, Sir. I have removed the subtitles.

Line 208: I think 7th should be written in word.

Done, thank you.

Line 210: The number below than 10 should be written in word.

Done, thank you.

Line 215: Please include recommendations in conclusion.

However, the longterm safety study of lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract is recommended.

Note: please kindly give a correction Sir, thank you.

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (1)

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

REFEREE: Reviewer | **Revision** (1) 19 Jun 2021

Dear AE,
Thanks for all the modifications the authors have done; however, there are still some points that need your attention:
1- Following comment 5 for reviewer 1, you inserted the full name of BHT, but you forgot to add the abbreviation the first time. I mean at the first time (in the chemicals part) full name and abbreviation should exist both. After the first time, you can only use the abbreviation.
2- Following Comment 5 for reviewer 1, Still there is somewhere with the wrong spell of melanin, e.g., the legend of table 1.
3- Following the comments of reviewer 2, Please remove "by" in this sentence: Its mechanism of action is by catalyzing L-tyrosine's hydroxylation reaction to L-DOPA and the oxidation of L-DOPA to dopaquinone, the two main reactions in melanin biosynthesis."
4- Please kindly rewrite the beginning of the second paragraph of 2.2.2. and change it to: "Mixing the oil phase and the water phase". I know the word "mixing" was your first choice and you changed it after the reviewer's comments, but this should be better.
5- Please change "smoking women" to" smoker women" in 2.2.3.2.
6- In this part:
"In this study, the lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract and placebo were tested using Finn chamber patches attached to the skin on the back. The patches were then removed after 24 hours. Skin reactions were observed and evaluated after 1 hour, 24 hours, and 72 hours. The patches were removed. The reactions observed were in the form of allergies and irritation objectively and subjectively."
Why there are two sentences about patch removal? Also if you use "a" then you should use "Finn chamber patch" not "patches".
7- In this sentence remove parentheses: Lotion is applied on the volar (forearm).
8- In this phrase "as much as 0.5 g (area 40-50 mm2)", use 2 as superscript; i.e. mm2. You did not change it in fact.
9- There are still some "t-test" with uppercase T in the beginning. you had to change them to lowercase as the reviewer's comment.
Good Luck!

Olalere Abayomi Olusegun: Associate Editor | **Revision** (1) 19 Jun 2021

Dear EIC
The reviewer(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some minor revisions to

the manuscript. Therefore, I invite the author to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise his manuscript.
Kind regards,

REFEREE: EIC | **Revision (1)** 19 Jun 2021

Dear Authors,
Reviewers have scrutinized your revised manuscript; It seems minor revision is required. We would consider it for publication if you submit the revised version, including the point-to-point answer to the comments.
We are looking forward to receiving your revised manuscript.
Kind Regards,
JJNPP EIC

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (2)

Reply to Reviewers

Ideally, the reviewing process can significantly improve the submitted manuscripts by allowing the authors to take into account the advice of reviewers. Author(s) must reply to all reviewers' comments in a separate Word file, point by point. A "**Reply to Reviewers**" document is submitted along with revised manuscript during submission of revised files, summarizing the changes that the authors made in response to the reviewers' comments. The responses to reviewers' comments specifies how the authors addressed each comment the reviewers made.

You can read the authors' responses to the reviewers' comments in the next page.

Dear Reviewer, thank you for replying and revising. Here are my replies:

1- Following the comment 5 for reviewer 1, you inserted the full name of BHT, but you forgot to add the abbreviation at the first time. I mean at the first time (in chemicals part) full name and abbreviation should exist both. After the first time, you can only use the abbreviation.

I have it done, Sir. Abbreviation and full name in first time.

2- Following the Comment 5 for reviewer 1, Still there are somewhere with the wrong spell of melanin, e.g., legend of table 1.

Done for melanin typo Sir, thank you.

3- Following the comments of reviewer 2, Please remove "by" in this sentence: Its mechanism of action is by catalyzing L-tyrosine's hydroxylation reaction to L-DOPA and the oxidation of L-DOPA to dopaquinone, the two main reactions in melanin biosynthesis."

Done removing “by”, Sir. Thank you.

4- Please kindly rewrite the beginning of the second paragraph of 2.2.2. and change it to: "Mixing the oil phase and the water phase". I know the word "mixing" was your first choice and you changed it after reviewer's comments, but this should be better.

Done changing the first sentence, Sir. Thank you.

5- Please change "smoking women" to" smoker women" in 2.2.3.2.

Done changing to smoker, Sir, thank you.

6- In this part:

"In this study, the lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract and placebo were tested using a Finn chamber patches attached to the skin on the back. The patches were then removed after 24 hours. Skin reactions were observed and evaluated after 1 hour, 24 hours, and 72 hours. The patches were removed. The reactions observed were in the form of allergies and irritation objectively and subjectively."

Why there are two sentences about patch removal? Also if you use "a" then you should use "Finn chamber patch" not "patches".

Done changing sentences, Sir.

In this study, the lotion containing 10% black rice bran extract and placebo were tested using Finn chamber patches attached to the skin on the back. The patches were then removed after 24 hours. Skin reactions were observed and evaluated after 1 hour, 24 hours, and 72 hours after patches removal. The reactions observed were in the form of allergies and irritation objectively and subjectively

7- In this sentences remove parentheses: Lotion is applied on volar (forearm).

Done removing the parentheses, Sir, thank you

8- In this phrase "as much as 0.5 g (area 40-50 mm2)", use 2 as superscript; i.e. mm2. You did not change it in fact.

Done changing mm2 to mm^2, Sir, thank you.

9- There are still some "t-test" with uppercase T in the beginning. you had to change them to lowercase as the reviewer's comment.

Done changing T to t, Sir. Thank you.

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Revision (2)

Here, you can see the **Reviewers**, **Associate Editors** and **EICs'** comments from the beginning to the end of the revision process.

Olalere Abayomi Olusegun: Associate Editor | **Revision** (2) 22 Jun 2021

Dear EIC,
The authors have made considerable changes to the manuscript.
Thanks.

REFEREE: EIC | **Revision** (2) 22 Jun 2021

Dear Authors,
I am glad to inform you that your manuscript has been accepted for publication in the current form; it will send to the publisher for further processing.
Thank you for your interest in our journal.
Kind Regards,