Shiraz E-Medical Journal
Volume 22 · Issue 12 · e110822

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Relaxation Effects of Aromatherapy Intervention on Female and Male Anxiety: A Randomized Control Trial

Jamshid Eslami, Abed Ebrahimi, Isan Darvishi, khadijeh momeni, Marzieh Akbarzadeh

SUBMITTED	REVISED	ACCEPTED	DOI
23 Nov 2020	14 Mar 2021	23 May 2021	10.5812/semj.110822

About this report

This open peer review (OPR) report shows the public comments made on this article during peer review, by the reviewers, the associate editor and the editor-in-chief, for every revision round, together with the authors' replies. Comments appear only with the consent of the people who wrote them. Reviewers who chose to sign their report are named; the others are shown as "Referee". Comments are edited for language only, and confidential remarks to the editors are not included.

More about open peer review: brieflands.com/knowledgebase/opr

Contents

1 **Original submission** Referee 1 2
2 **Revision 1** Referee 1, Referee 2, Associate Editor 3
Authors' reply to reviewers 4
Reviewer and editor comments 9
3 **Revision 2** Referee 2, Associate Editor 10
Authors' reply to reviewers 11
Reviewer and editor comments 15

1 Original submission

1 comment · 22 Dec 2020

Referee 1 Reviewer

MINOR REVISION 22 Dec 2020

Thank you for your invitation.
The title is flawed, and the word "promotion" should not be used.

2

Revision 1

AUTHORS' RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS

Authors' reply to reviewers

The next pages contain the authors' point-by-point reply to the comments of this revision round, as submitted with the revised manuscript. It is published as the authors wrote it.

Reviewers' Comments:

Reviewer 1:

Thank you for your invitation:

The title is flawed and the word "promotion" should not be used

word "promotion" is deleted

Relaxation effects of Aromatherapy intervention on female and male anxiety: randomized control trials

Line 1-2

Reviewer 2:

1) Dear author there are lots of published articles that could give information to the reader of the topic such as your work as;

a) Citrus aurantium Aroma for Anxiety in Patients with Acute Coronary Syndrome: A Double-Blind Placebo-Controlled Trial published in 2019.

b) The effects of Citrus aurantium aroma on anxiety and fatigue in patients with acute myocardial infarction: A two-center, randomized, controlled trial. Published in 2020 and so on. Please let the reader to know what is the advantage of your study??

Due to the fact that anxiety disorders are more common in women than men, and these anxiety disorders in women often become more severe during hormonal fluctuations, including puberty period, before menstruation, pregnancy or after childbirth and menopause, therefore, the incidence of anxiety can also depend on gender. Since the prevalence of anxiety disorders in

women is higher than men and also according to According to the results of other studies on the effect of aromatherapy in reducing anxiety and anxiety in men and women and the lack of similar studies on comparison of the effect of *Citrus aurantium* aroma in reducing anxiety in men and women,

Line 50-51-52-53-60-61-62-63

2) Dear author please have a look again to your abstract. There is not enough information in the result section. However result section should contain the important body of abstract, there is only few sentence was written.

Results: After aromatherapy, 20% of men had mild state and trait anxiety, 80% had relatively mild state and trait anxiety, and in the group of women, 20% had mild state and trait anxiety, 73.3% had relatively mild state and trait anxiety, and 6/7% of the anxiety was relatively severe**.** In the aromatherapy in men and women group after the intervention, state and trait anxiety patients was reduced (P <0.001).In addition, the severity of anxiety in women in the control group increased after placebo intervention (P <0.05). Also, the effect of *citrus aurantium* aroma was observed more in women than men but there was no statistically significant difference (P> 0.05).

Line 17-18-19-20

3) The idea of this manuscript is not new.

This study is new due to the lack of similar studies comparing the effect of uranium citrus scent on reducing anxiety in men and women.

Line 60-61-62-63

Reviewer 3:

Dear authors

In the article (Relaxation effects of Aromatherapy intervention on promotion female and

2 male anxiety: a prospective, randomized, placebo controlled study),These points are recommended:

1. Article is long, so it should be max word count 3500 or based on journal standard.

Word count decreased

2. Title changed: promotion anxiety to reduced anxiety or anxiety level, because it mistake; so in the title write« randomized control trials» vs «a prospective, randomized, placebo controlled study».

Relaxation effects of Aromatherapy intervention on female and male anxiety: randomized control trials

Line 1-2

3. In the abstract section is better that instead of postoperative care, a sentence for preoperative care should be included because you did not evaluate the postoperative results.

Postoperative care was misspelled and corrected to preoperative care

Line 5

4. Both table4 ,5 title isn't descriptive, Modify the title of the descriptive table to analytical table.

The titles of Tables 4 and 5 were changed from descriptive to analytical tables.

Line 271-278

5. Results repeated both text and tables, so modify.

-In the description of Table 1, we have written a very brief information about the demographic characteristics of the patients. Most of the information is in the tables and more information is avoided in the text.

- We deleted the duplicates and general information about Tables 2 and 3 was written in the text of the article.

- In relation to Tables 4, 5 and 6, general information is written in text and comprehensive information is provided only in tables.

Line 132-133-134

6. In the results did not evaluated of the mood score, Therefore in the conclusion ,it delete.

The word "state" was misspelled by the "mood" and corrected

Line224

7. the discussion write based on all of results.

The discussion was completed based on the results

Sincerely

Associate Editor's Comments:

Associate Editor 1:
N/A

EIC Decision:

The article needs major revision .

Uploaded Files by Reviewers/Associate Editor/EIC:

Below you can find list of files attached by reviewers or associate editor or EIC during the review process (if any).

2 Revision 1

3 comments · 24 Feb 2021 – 2 Mar 2021

Referee 1 Reviewer

ACCEPT 24 Feb 2021

The suggested changes have been made in this article, and the article is acceptable.

Referee 2 Reviewer

MAJOR REVISION 1 Mar 2021

Dear authors
This article is very poorly reported, but the following recommendations are made:
1. What was the sample size: 15 or 30? Both 15 and 30 were reported in section (3.1) and Table 1, ...
2. In the methods section: where and when was the intervention conducted?
3. If these were part of the survey results, they should be reported accurately and correctly. For example, Tables 4, 5, and 6 should use a paired test (with before and after results), not a T-test. In Table 1, report mean (SD) and N (%) above the columns, ...
4. Why was midlife selected? Explain in the introduction and discussion.

Good day

Associate Editor

MAJOR REVISION 2 Mar 2021

The reviewers are not convinced.

3

Revision 2

AUTHORS' RESPONSE TO REVIEWERS

Authors' reply to reviewers

The next pages contain the authors' point-by-point reply to the comments of this revision round, as submitted with the revised manuscript. It is published as the authors wrote it.

:Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer 1:

The suggested comments are applied in this article and the article is acceptable.

Very hanks

Dear Dr Reviewer 2:

Dear authors

1.This article reported very weak, but these commences recommended:

Studies have shown that adults become anxious due to the cost of treatment and the length of hospital stay. The history of hospitalization and the experiences gained from family and friends affect their level of anxiety. Anxiety disorders are more common in women than men. Anxiety disorders caused by surgery have been studied. Therefore, this study is new and in our opinion is very practical because its results can be used instead of industrial drugs, a fragrance that is very common in Fars

As stated in studies, adults :(Translation of the English text above) experience anxiety because of the burden of treatment costs and the length of hospitalization; a history of hospitalization and the experiences gained from relatives and friends affect their level of anxiety. On the other hand, since anxiety disorders are more prevalent in women than in men, this study, in view of the above, specifically targeted individuals aged 40 years and older, both men and women, and examined the effect of the aroma of bitter orange blossom (Citrus aurantium), the dominant and characteristic scent of Shiraz, in the treatment of anxiety disorders caused by surgery. Therefore, this study is new and, in our view, highly practical, because based on its results, instead of industrial drugs, an aroma that is abundant .in Fars Province and Shiraz can be used

2.. What was sample size ?15 or 30? Because reported both 15 and 30 in the section (3.1) and table 1, ...

The total number of participants was 60, with 15 men and 15 women in each group of 30 people (Aromatherapy and Control Group).

Line 67.68

2. In the method section : where was intervention? And When ?

It was performed in hospitals affiliated to Shiraz University of Medical Sciences in 2018.

Line 65,66

3. If these were the part of results the survey so should be reported exactly and correctly . For example: table of 4,5,6 should be done paired test (with before and after results) not T- test , in table 1 report mean(SD) and N(%) above columns,...

Table 1: was modified according to the comments

The statistics professor who performed the analysis said, in response to the above question, that in Tables 4 and 5, which concerned one group before and after, the paired t-test was used, and in Table 6, which compared the intervention and control groups, the independent t-test was .used. The type of test is added below the tables

Table1 line 239

Table4,5 line 254,262

Table6 line 270

4. why selected midlife age? In the introduction and discussion explain .

On the other hand, one of the effective factors on anxiety is age. Adults become anxious due

to the cost of treatment and the length of hospital stay. Hospitalization history and experiences gained from family and friends also affect patients' anxiety levels.

Since one of the factors affecting anxiety is age (5). Therefore, in this study, in order to limit the interfering factor, the age of people aged 40 years and older were included in the study

Line 31,32,33,34,164,165,166

Good day

Dear Dr Reviewer 3:

Dear author this study is not new.

Citrus aurantium refers to the bitter orange fruit. The juice, peel, and pulp can be taken orally. They have been used to ease anxiety, digestion, and sleeplessness. Citrus aurantium has also been used to promote weight loss. So What is the point??

This study is new because it examines the anti-anxiety properties of spring orange scent between the sexes (men and women). Due to the fact that anxiety disorders are more common in women than men, and these anxiety disorders in women often become more severe during hormonal fluctuations, such as during puberty, before menstruation, pregnancy or after childbirth and menopause. Therefore, the incidence of anxiety can also depend on gender. We have now examined whether the anti-anxiety properties of spring orange have a different effect between the sexes or whether the anti-anxiety properties of spring orange have the same effect between different sexes. In the research conducted by

the research team, no study was found that examined the effect of spring orange between the sexes. Also, in this study, the control group was used to strengthen the study.

Line 48, 49, 50,51,60,61

Translation of the above text: This study is new in that it examines the anti-anxiety property of bitter orange blossom aroma across the sexes (women and men). Since anxiety disorders are more prevalent in women than in men, and these anxiety disorders in women often become more severe at times of hormonal fluctuation, such as puberty, before menstruation, during pregnancy or after childbirth, and at menopause, the incidence of anxiety may also depend on sex. We therefore examined whether the anti-anxiety property of bitter orange blossom has a different effect in the two sexes or the same effect in both. In the searches conducted by the research team, no study was found that had examined ,the effect of bitter orange blossom by sex

---

Associate Editor's Comments:

Associate Editor 1:
The reviewers are not convinced.

[.*Translated from Persian by the Brieflands editorial office*]

3 Revision 2

2 comments · 11 May 2021 – 22 May 2021

Referee 2 Reviewer

ACCEPT 11 May 2021

Dear authors

The revisions to the article are approved.
thanks

Associate Editor

ACCEPT 22 May 2021

Accept